

- **The Spirituality of Klaus Bockmuehl: His Practice and Teaching on Listening to God**
- *La spiritualité de Klaus Bockmühl. Son Enseignement et sa pratique de l'écoute de Dieu*
- *Die Spiritualität in Lehre und Leben Klaus Bockmühls*

Arthur Dicken Thomas, Jr., Washington DC., USA.

RÉSUMÉ

Klaus Bockmühl (1931–1989), défenseur de la théologie luthérienne et calviniste, a, dans son dernier ouvrage *A l'Ecoute du Dieu qui parle*, (Hören auf den Gott, der redet), avancé l'affirmation controversée : 'quand les gens écoutent, Dieu parle'. La spiritualité de Bockmühl mérite qu'on y soit très attentif, car il était l'un des théologiens évangéliques les plus marquants dans le monde germanophone au cours des dernières décennies. Il a enseigné la théologie à la Faculté de St Chrischona près de Bâle (1971–77) et au Regent College de Vancouver au Canada (1977–89). Peu avant d'apprendre qu'il était atteint du cancer, Bockmühl fut informé de la création, par un groupe de chrétiens évangéliques, d'une chaire spéciale de théologie subventionnée, à l'université de Bâle, dont on souhaitait qu'il soit le premier titulaire. Vu sa santé défaillante, ce projet ne put se réaliser. Il a publié 24 ouvrages en allemand et en anglais, sans compter des dizaines d'articles et de traités. Plusieurs de ses livres ont été traduits en hollandais, en italien, en portugais, en finlandais et en français. Bien que ses oeuvres de théologie systématique et d'éthique soient mieux connues, avant de mourir il choisit de publier *A l'Ecoute du Dieu qui parle* comme son testament pour l'Eglise.

Le présent article présente la thèse de Bockmühl. La première partie considère trois mouvements qui, dans sa jeunesse (1931–61), ont influencé sa pratique de l'écoute de Dieu : le piétisme allemand de A. H. Francke et Wilhelm Busch; le Réarmement Moral de Frank Buchman et Alan Thornhill, et la spiritualité médiévale de St Augustin et de Bernard de Clairvaux. On y trouve des détails sur la conversion de Bockmühl, en 1946 ou 1947, lors des retraites pour la jeunesse de

Wilhelm Busch à Hespital. L'auteur montre comment Bockmühl a pris la défense du modèle piétiste pour l'Eglise d'aujourd'hui, comment il a adopté le principe du mouvement du Réarmement Moral qui consiste à se laisser conduire par Dieu. Il évoque ses relations avec Karl Barth et Jürgen Moltmann, sa consécration comme pasteur de l'Eglise nationale allemande en 1961, et son désir de corriger un déséquilibre dans l'enseignement de Luther et de Calvin sur l'écoute de Dieu, en s'inspirant d'exemples bibliques ou de pratiques du Moyen-Age.

La seconde partie présente son enseignement sur le discernement de la volonté de Dieu d'après des principes bibliques, et montre comment il l'a appliqué dans les circonstances qui ont marqué la fin de sa vie, de 1961 à 1989: sa controverse à Bâle au sujet de l'homosexualité, qui lui a coûté son habilitation sous Henrick van Oyen, sa critique énergique du marxisme, à l'université de Heidelberg, qui provoqua l'opposition de la communauté protestante des étudiants d'Allemagne, mais où l'appui de la mission évangélique parmi les étudiants lui évita d'être destitué de sa charge d'aumônier de l'université; puis son ministère à St. Chrischona et sa nomination au Regent College. Enfin, son expérience de la grâce de Dieu au cours de sa dernière maladie, et son expérience de l'amour divin, renouvelées par la lecture des écrits de Julien de Norwich, et par son amitié avec James Houston, professeur de théologie spirituelle au Regent College.

La spiritualité de Bockmühl suivait la voie évangélique et piétiste de la méditation, en insistant sur le fait que le moyen le plus sûr pour découvrir la volonté de Dieu est de sonder l'Ecriture. Cependant il faisait un pas de plus

que la plupart des protestants en enseignant que les croyants peuvent percevoir ce que Dieu les appelle à faire s'ils sont fidèles dans la méditation de l'Écriture et la recherche, dans la prière, de la volonté de Dieu. Celle-ci peut leur devenir claire pour savoir à quels péchés renoncer, comment écrire des livres ou préparer des messages, quel réconfort trouver dans l'épreuve et quelles tâches accomplir dans la famille et dans la société. Dans cette écoute jointe à la prière, Bockmühl avait constaté que des idées perspicaces lui venaient qui ne dérivait pas de la seule raison.

Bockmühl voulait que sa vie de piété aille au-delà d'une simple méditation discursive de l'Écriture visant à appliquer le sens original de celle-ci à sa propre vie. Tout en préférant la

méditation et la prière à partir d'un texte sacré, il recherchait aussi l'expérience que d'autres appellent la contemplation, ou la concentration aimante de l'âme entière sur Dieu d'une façon toute simple. Il enseignait que nous pouvons aimer Dieu directement et ressentir son amour. Son journal personnel révèle une grande intimité avec Dieu dans la ligne du piétisme, et un plaisir à contempler Dieu, inspiré des auteurs mystiques du Moyen-Âge. Aux yeux de Bockmühl, cette approche de l'écoute de Dieu impliquait la régularité dans la pratique de la piété, la purification du péché, la direction divine dans l'emploi du temps, la consolation dans l'épreuve, l'amour pour Dieu et pour le prochain.

ZUSAMMENFASSUNG

Klaus Bockmühl (1931–1989), ein Vertreter lutherischer und calvinistischer Theologie, stellte in seinem letzten Buch Hören auf den Gott, der redet, die umstrittene Hypothese auf, daß, wenn Menschen zuhören, Gott auch redet. Bockmühls Spiritualität verdient besondere Beachtung, weil er einer der prominentesten deutschsprachigen evangelikalischen Theologen der letzten Jahrzehnte war. Er war Theologieprofessor am Prediger- und Missionsseminar St. Chrischona in Basel (1971–77) und am Regent College, Vancouver, Kanada (1977–89). Kurz bevor er von seiner Krebserkrankung erfuhr, wurde Bockmühl mitgeteilt, daß eine Gruppe von Evangelikalen eine Stiftungsprofessur für Theologie an der Universität Basel eingerichtet hatte und ihn dafür vorschlagen wollte. Seine Erkrankung machte dieses Vorhaben unmöglich. Vierundzwanzig Werke Bockmühls sind in englisch und deutsch erschienen, neben dutzenden kürzeren Schriften und Artikeln. Viele seiner Bücher wurden auf holländisch, italienisch, portugiesisch, finnisch und französisch übersetzt. Obwohl er besser für seine Arbeit in systematischer Theologie und Ethik bekannt ist, beschloß der sterbende Bockmühl, das Buch Hören auf den Gott, der redet als eine Art Testament und letzten Willen an die Kirche zu schreiben.

Dieser Artikel analysiert Bockmühls

Hauptaussagen in diesem Buch. Der erste Teil untersucht drei Bewegungen, die seine Lebensführung im Hören auf Gott während seiner frühen Jahre (1931–61) prägten: der deutsche Pietismus A. H. Franckes und Wilhelm Buschs, das Moral Re-Armament Frank Buchmans und Alan Thornhills und die mittelalterliche Spiritualität von Augustin und Bernhard von Clairvaux. Unter anderem behandelt dieser Abschnitt seine Bekehrung im Jahre 1946 oder 1947 bei einer von Buschs Jugendfreizeiten in Hespital, sein Eintreten für ein pietistisches Modell für die Kirche der Gegenwart, seine Aufnahme der Lehre von göttlicher Führung nach dem Vorbild der Moral Re-Armament Bewegung, seine Beziehung zu Karl Barth und Jürgen Moltmann, seine Ordination als Pfarrer der deutschen Landeskirche 1961 und sein Streben, die z. T. einseitigen Lehren von Luther und Calvin über das Hören auf Gott durch die Wiederentdeckung biblischer und mittelalterlicher Modelle zu korrigieren.

Der zweite Teil behandelt seine Lehraussagen über das Erkennen des Willens Gottes, ausgehend von biblischen Prinzipien, die dann anhand der Ereignisse in späteren Lebensabschnitten Bockmühls ausgewertet werden (1961–89). Diese Ereignisse besprechen unter anderem seine Disputation über Homosexualität in Basel, die ihn seine Habilitation unter Henrick Van Oyen kostete,

seine heftige Kritik an Marx, die an der Universität Heidelberg eine stürmische Kritik von Seiten der evangelischen Studentengemeinde in Deutschland hervorrief, so daß nur die Unterstützung durch die evangelische Studentenmission ihn davor bewahrte, seine Stelle als Studentenpfarrer zu verlieren. Dazu gehören auch die Jahre auf St. Chrischona, sein Ruf ans Regent College, seine Erfahrung göttlicher Gnade während seiner Krankheit, ebenso wie seine immer tiefergehende Erfahrung göttlicher Liebe anhand der Schriften von Julian of Norwich und die geistlich geprägte Freundschaft mit James Houston, Professor für Spiritualität (spiritual theology) am Regent College.

Bockmühls Spiritualität folgte dem evangelikalen und pietistischen Vorbild der Meditation über die Heilige Schrift als verlässlichsten Zugang zur Erkenntnis des Willens Gottes. Doch Bockmühl ging einen Schritt weiter als die vorherrschende protestantische Tradition, indem er betonte, daß Gläubige fühlen können, was Gottes Führung für ihr Leben ist, wenn sie treu und anhaltend meditativ die Schrift studieren und im Gebet nach Gottes Willen fragen. Diese Führung Gottes erstreckt sich auf Bereiche wie: die Warnung vor Sünde im Einzelfall, die Entscheidung, welche Bücher gelesen und welche Vorträge vorbereitet werden sollten, Ermutigung in Leidenszeiten, und konkrete

Führung in Bezug auf Pflichten im Familienleben und in der Gesellschaft. Im Kontext des betenden Hörens auf Gott machte Bockmühl die Erfahrung, daß er Einsichten und Einfälle bekam, die ihm nicht allein durch den Gebrauch seines Verstandes zugänglich waren.

Bockmühl wollte zu einem geistlichen Leben durchbrechen, das über das bloße diskursive Nachdenken über die Schrift und die Anwendung des ursprünglichen Textsinns auf das eigene Leben hinausging. Obwohl er Meditation und Gebet über die Heilige Schrift als wichtigsten Schritt ansah, suchte Bockmühl auch nach jener Erfahrung, die andere Kontemplation oder einfaches liebendes Aufmerken der ganzen Seele auf Gott nennen. Er lehrte, daß wir Gott unmittelbar lieben können und gleichzeitig seine Liebe auch direkt erfahren können. Viele seiner Schriften spiegeln seine herzliche und persönliche Erfahrung der Gegenwart Gottes, die so charakteristisch für die pietistische Spiritualität ist, ebenso wie das kontemplative Element als Erbe der spirituellen Schriftsteller des Mittelalters. Die biblischen Dimensionen in Bockmühls praktischem Hören auf Gott beinhalten: Regelmäßigkeit, Reinigung von Schuld, Führung in der Lebensplanung, Führung in persönlichem Leid und Liebe zu Gott und den Mitmenschen.

Klaus Bockmuehl, late professor of theology at St. Chrischona in Basel and Regent College in Vancouver, expressed a rich devotional life that inspired all of his academic writing and teaching. His inner spiritual journey derived from a daily practice of attending to God speaking through Scripture and prayerful meditation. When he discovered that he had terminal cancer, he felt directed by God to lay aside a book which he was preparing on ethics in order to devote all of his remaining strength to writing *Listening to the God Who Speaks* as his last will and testament to the church.

He desired to preserve the secret of his communion with God for posterity. Fiercely determined to complete this work despite the pain of illness, he established the

importance he attached to the subject of listening in solitude. He witnessed its completion during the last week of his life in 1989, although his friend James Houston, had to edit the final chapter.

The book builds upon Bockmuehl's previous work, *Living by the Gospel*, in which he bemoaned the fact that Protestants have largely forgotten about the gift of the Holy Spirit and have become practical atheists, for they seem to have no need for God in making decisions about daily life.¹ To correct the imbalance in much Protestant and evangelical spirituality, Bockmuehl wrote *Listening to the God Who Speaks*, revealing the foundation of his own piety: a life based upon listening for God to guide his steps into the knowledge of the divine will. By reflect-

ing on 'God's guidance from Scripture and the lives of God's people,' Bockmuehl advanced the highly contested proposition that 'when people listen, God speaks.'²

This article will analyze Bockmuehl's thesis in *Listening to the God Who Speaks* by first examining three movements that influenced his practice of listening in the early days of his life from 1931 to 1961. These included German Pietism, Moral Re-Armament, and Medieval Spirituality. Then it will study the principles he reaped from Bible study on hearing God and indicates his application of these during major events in his life during the period 1961 to 1989.

Bockmuehl's spirituality deserves careful consideration because he was one of the most prominent evangelical theologians in the German-speaking world. He ministered in the *Landeskirche*, a union of the Lutheran and Reformed Churches in Germany. As a result, this theologian claimed both Martin Luther and John Calvin as theological models for his life. J. I. Packer, called him 'a brilliant analytical thinker, a masterful teacher, a superb colleague, and a holy servant of God.'³ Twenty-four of Bockmuehl's books have been published in English and German besides dozens of articles and pamphlets. He is better known among the German and the Swiss than North Americans, but his following grew among the latter when he became professor of systematic theology and Christian ethics at Regent College, Vancouver, Canada in 1977. Many of his titles have been translated into Dutch, Italian, Portuguese, Finnish, and French.⁴

Klaus Bockmuehl's works were both prolific and respected; he had one goal: 'a return to the will of God in theology and in the Church.' According to Helmut Burkhardt, Klaus Bockmuehl's piety developed not only from 'listening to God as the individual application of God's revealed will,' but also as a result of 'the constant retuning of the Christian life to the standard of God's commandments, above all the Ten Commandments.'⁵ Although there have been numerous books on prayer, meditation, and guidance in recent years, few have been written by theologians. *Listening to the God Who Speaks* adds to this body of literature, since it is written by a systematic theologian

who wrote not with academic aloofness but as one who practised listening on a daily basis. Bockmuehl made a conscious effort to combine insights from the disciplines of systematic, moral, and spiritual theologies in his last work and, yet, wrote with a simplicity such as to move people of varying educational backgrounds.

I. Influential Movements in Bockmuehl's Life

German Pietism

The earliest influence upon Bockmuehl's spiritual journey was German Pietism. Throughout his academic career, Bockmuehl preferred to call himself a 'Pietist' rather than an 'evangelical.' Of course, he taught at Regent College, a stronghold of evangelicalism, and identified with the evangelical renaissance of the twentieth century; nevertheless the term 'Pietism' more accurately defines his roots and the essence of his spirituality. Bockmuehl valued classical German Lutheran Pietism, as advocated by its leading statesmen, Philipp Jakob Spener (1635–1705) and August Hermann Francke (1663–1727). These writers insisted on the necessity of examining Scriptures with a spirit of devotion both privately at home and collectively in small groups. One scholar, Peter C. Erb, considered Pietism the most important development in Protestant spirituality.⁷ A Regent colleague, James I. Packer, noted that Bockmuehl was a Pietist 'in the noble sense in which Spener and Francke, Whitefield and Wesley, Edwards and Brainerd, were Pietists: that is to say, he . . . was moved by his personal knowledge of God's grace and forgiveness to all kinds of compassionate efforts for others' benefits.'⁸

The kind of Pietism taught by Spener and Francke found the key to the spiritual life in the heart (i.e.—the will and affections), the place of contact between God and souls. It stressed personal religious experience, particularly repentance (the acknowledgment of one's own sinfulness before God and of one's own requirement of grace) and sanctification (the experience of personal development in holiness). Pietism emphasized Bible study, the necessity of regeneration, the importance of fellowship groups, and *orthopraxis* (right

living and holiness). Pietists like these wanted pastoral training to correct an over-emphasis upon academic and polemical theology by giving more attention to devotional and moral implications of the faith. Many Pietists were also involved in the social issues of their day.⁹

Klaus Erich Bockmuehl—the son of Erich Bockmuehl, a mechanical engineer, and his wife Hanna Ihlo—grew up in the Ruhr region of Germany where Pietist spirituality was still in evidence. He was born in Essen on May 6, 1931. What exposure he had to true piety came from his devout grandmother who lived in Essen. He did not encounter German Pietism from either of his parents; his father did not belong to church and his mother rarely attended.

During World War II, Bockmuehl was separated from his parents when his school was evacuated to Austria for safety. He returned to Essen at the end of the war a young man of fourteen, with a maturity beyond his years. Shortly after this he was confirmed in the Lutheran *Landeskirche*. Much to his regret, his father did not attend this solemn occasion. Confirmation seemed more of an adolescent *rite de passage* than a spiritual awakening for Klaus Bockmuehl.

Afterwards he was invited to become part of a strong Christian youth movement at the Weigle Haus [*die Jugendarbeit im Essener Weigle-Haus des Christlicher Verein Junger Männer*]. Pastor Wilhelm Busch, whose family had Pietist roots in Württemberg, had begun this outreach to youth on behalf of the *Landeskirche*. Busch was a true successor to the vision of Spener and Francke. His life was influenced by the examples of other Pietists such as Gottfried Daniel Krummacher, Alfred Christlieb, Friedrich von Bodelschwingh, and Nils Hauge.¹⁰ About eight hundred boys came to his meetings in Essen when Bockmuehl was first influenced by his dynamic preaching and Bible teaching.

Busch had been part of the Confessing Church during the regime of Adolf Hitler. Unlike most leaders in the state church, Busch, along with other members of the Confessing Church, refused to acknowledge the compatibility of Christianity with Hitler's views on racial superiority, anti-Semitism, and German nationalism. Nazi officials

arrested leaders of the Confessing Church such as Martin Niemöller, Dietrich Bonhoeffer, and Wilhelm Busch for their criticism of the government and placed them in prison.¹¹

After the war, Pastor Busch worked to rebuild Germany by ministering to its youth. Here Bockmuehl witnessed first hand a vibrant form of Pietism. Busch held large worship services on Sunday mornings for the boys. With both spiritual and social needs in mind, he not only held Bible studies, prayer meetings, and weekend retreats, but also provided games, hikes, soccer matches, and dramatic reading of novels. Almost four hundred of these boys eventually became pastors. Some also became theologians like Klaus Bockmuehl.

About 1946 or 1947 Bockmuehl went with friends to one of Busch's youth retreats at Hespetal. One day Bockmuehl and his friend Karl Sundermeier were enjoying conversation under a tree as Bockmuehl was constructing a wooden cross from branches of a tree. An unknown person appeared out of the bushes and began to attack the Person of Christ and what faith in him meant. Bockmuehl wondered at the time if this could be the devil himself or an attack of the devil through another person. After much argumentation, this unknown person soon disappeared. The two students were shocked. Their previous beliefs were challenged. This nefarious encounter precipitated a crisis in Bockmuehl's life. Sundermeier was already a believer, but Bockmuehl was not. Since some one had come to destroy his faith, Bockmuehl felt that it was time to commit his life to Christ. There under the tree with the wooden cross in his hand, Bockmuehl responded to Christ's call to become one of his followers. He considered this his moment of evangelical conversion and consequently valued the cross he had made as visible reminder of his hour of grace. This cross hung in his study wherever he moved. It is still prized by members of his family.

Bockmuehl had undergone conversion [*Bekehrung*] in a manner advocated by Francke, Busch, and other Pietists. Francke was insistent that 'a new creation occur in each who would be in Christ.' He argued: 'As he was first born of his parents in a natural

way, he had also to be born of God in a spiritual-supernatural way, that he might become a new man.¹² Pietists found the formalistic Christianity practised by the Lutheran Scholastics deficient in vital piety. They desired evidence of an inner transformation and the impartation of a new spiritual nature as a sign of true conversion. Following the Pietists, Bockmuehl taught his students to value Francke's three steps in the conversion process: (1) conviction of sin, (2) certainty of grace, and (3) awareness of being called to the service of God.¹³

The Pietist vision he had gained from Busch remained with him the rest of his life. In 1985 Bockmuehl published *Die Aktualität des Pietismus* (*The Importance of Pietism for Today*) to recommend the Pietist approach to the contemporary church in Europe.¹⁴ Those looking for quotations from Pietist authors in *Listening to the God Who Speaks* will discover that Bockmuehl cites only one, but they will discern a spirituality nurtured by the devotional practices of the Pietists. In this book he cited only one Pietist, J. A. Bengel, the famous German Bible commentator. Bengel believed that followers of Jesus could receive new insights from the Risen Christ. He interpreted passages in John 14 and 16 to mean that 'the Holy Spirit would teach them [the disciples] other things too—things that Jesus had not yet told them' when he had still been on earth (p. 67).

In his lectures at Regent College Bockmuehl commended the conventicles (small groups) advocated by Spener and Francke in which students discussed ways of applying Scripture to daily life.¹⁵ Francke believed that serious study of Scripture was imperative for the maintenance of a relationship with God and a continual growth in holiness. As editor of Regent's journal, Bockmuehl published Francke's 'Short Course of Instructions on How Holy Scripture Ought to Be Read for One's True Edification' in *Crux* after discovering that his friend Manfred Fleischmann had recently translated it. Francke's practice of meditating and praying with Scripture was similar to that advocated by Bockmuehl in *Listening to the God Who Speaks*. Half of the work deals with Bockmuehl's analysis of biblical themes of listening to God speak by meditation on

God's word. Francke stressed the importance of prayer going hand in hand with meditation upon Scripture: 'If we rush through a chapter, slam the Bible shut, and soon dismiss from our minds what we have read, it is but little wonder that we can read the Bible time and time again without becoming more reverent and devout.' Francke continued: 'If meditation does not come easily, you must pray; and if prayer does not come easily, pause to think about the words you read. Prayer will lead to and will increase meditation; meditation will awaken you to prayer.' Proper meditation also involved 'self-examination' so that 'through the Word of God, we may correctly discern the waywardness of our heart, and our heart be transformed according to the pattern of its wholesome teaching.'¹⁶

Moral Re-Armament

Another influence in Bockmuehl's life had close affinities with the Pietist emphasis upon devotional reading of Scripture and the necessity of having a transforming conversion. This was Moral Re-Armament. In *Listening to the God Who Speaks* he paid tribute to the Oxford Group or Moral Re-Armament, because this organization raised the issue 'of whether God can or does speak to humans today' (p. 5). He claimed to have attended several of their plays and noted: 'If one asked the poets, composers and playwrights to describe the source of their inspiration, they pointed to 'the Spirit's guidance' and to the quiet times of listening to God' (p. 6). What was this movement, and how did it impact the life of Klaus Bockmuehl?

This movement first began at Oxford University in 1921 under the American Lutheran clergyman, Frank Buchman (1876–1961). Because of its early association with this university, it received the name 'the Oxford Group.' Though originally centered on university students, the movement began to hold 'house parties' or rallies where its message was articulated by Buchman and others. It drew aristocrats, diplomats, intellectuals, and wealthy people as well as trade unionists and workers who were interested in changing their world. Buchman taught that humans were sinners who could

be radically changed through conversion and guidance by God and other believers. With the threat of war, Buchman changed his focus and organized it under the name 'Moral Re-Armament' in 1938 when he called for 'a movement of moral and spiritual re-armament throughout the world.'¹⁷

After World War II, Bockmuehl heard Buchman speak and thereafter read his books. It is important to examine Buchman's teaching on guidance, since Bockmuehl acknowledged his indebtedness to Buchman in *Listening to the God Who Speaks*. Following his conversion at Keswick in 1908, Buchman arrived at Pennsylvania State College a different person as he worked for the Y.M.C.A. On a campus visit, the celebrated British Evangelical, F. B. Meyer, asked Buchman: 'Do you let the Holy Spirit guide you in all you are doing?' Buchman answered that he did certainly pray and read the Bible in the morning and at times received inspirations. Meyer persisted, 'But do you give God enough uninterrupted time really to tell you what to do?' Buchman decided to give God the period between five and six o'clock each morning as a 'quiet time' with God. He decided he must do God's work not in his own manner, but according to God's plan. He resolved not just to talk to God but to listen to him as well.¹⁸ Bockmuehl quoted Buchman's speech: 'When man listens, God speaks. When man obeys, God acts.' Buchman argued, 'We are not out to tell God. We are out to let God tell us ... The lesson the world most needs is the art of listening to God.'¹⁹

Besides stressing the importance of listening to God, Buchman came to stress four absolutes found in the life of Jesus—absolute honesty, absolute purity, absolute unselfishness, and absolute love.²⁰ Along with other authors, Buchman influenced Bockmuehl in his lifelong emphasis upon the pursuit of holiness. Later in life Bockmuehl wrote to Garth Lean, historian of the movement, about his appreciation for its work: 'The genius of Moral Re-Armament is to bring the central spiritual substance of Christianity ... in a secular and accessible form.' He continued: 'Hence the emphasis on absolute moral standards. But the direction of the Holy Spirit is just as essential.' 'The genius,'

stressed Bockmuehl, 'is in the balance of the two.'²¹

In 1948 Buchman had the play, *The Forgotten Factor*, translated into German at Caux, the movement's headquarters.²² Buchman and Dr. Heinrich Kost, the head of the German Coal Board, spent four hours together. After listening for God's guidance, Kost had the idea of inviting a German cast of this play into the coal mines at Moers. Bockmuehl first encountered Moral Re-Armament when Buchman arranged to have Thornhill's play performed at Essen on 23 November 1948 near the ruined Krupp Factory. The Lord Mayor Gustav Heinemann, later President of the German Federal Republic, introduced the production. Alan Thornhill had written the play in thirty-six hours even though he had never composed one previously. The play analyzed the relations 'between and within the families of an industrialist and a labor leader at a time of industrial crisis and suggested the importance of a change of attitude from "who is right" to "what is right!"' Over a million people in a dozen countries attended it. Often its message assisted in settling conflicts of varying labour disputes.²³

Upon hearing of the productions of the play, Wilhelm Bush engaged Bockmuehl and others to help the play move around, construct the stage, shift the scenery, invite miners to attend, and pray for them during the acts. Within the first two years, approximately 120,000 Germans, largely from coal and steel industries, attended this play in the Ruhr region. It influenced many Marxists to become Christians or at least to reexamine their ideologies. Before the showing of the play, Communists held about 72 percent of the council seats in the coal works and steel industries. Two years later, the percentage of Communist representation had decreased to 25 percent. Hubert Stein, an executive member of the German miners' union, argued that the decline was 'to a great extent due to Moral Re-Armament.'²⁴ Dr. Hans Böckler, President of the new unified German Trades Union Federation, spoke of the impact that Moral Re-Armament was having in its meetings and plays: 'Some people hold the doctrine that you have to change the system in order to change society.' He felt

this was true, but only half the truth. 'People must change drastically like those men who spoke to us at Kost's meeting.' He continued: 'Both must be done, and you must fight for both, I am convinced of that.' These sentiments would later influence the thought of Bockmuehl.²⁵

During the first years of his Christian pilgrimage, Bockmuehl witnessed the creativity that came to Moral Re-Armament writers and workers who had learned to listen to God. He valued their guidance and became involved in the pressing social conditions in devastated Germany. He chose to identify with this group as it presented a Christian alternative to Marxism. In later life Bockmuehl followed through on his early convictions when he published, *The Challenge of Marxism: A Christian Response*.²⁶

Because of his help with the performances, Bockmuehl, then a student in the gymnasium, was invited along with German industrialists, trade unionists, and students to a Moral Re-Armament Conference in 1949 where he heard Buchman. At that time Bockmuehl planned to become a chemical engineer to work in the Ruhr with industry. At its centre at Caux, Switzerland, he shared a room with a Swiss worker who shared each morning what he received during his meditations. One day, after setting up the stage, Bockmuehl asked what else he should he do. His roommate told him to go back to his room and have a quiet time alone with God. During this silence, Bockmuehl sensed God call him to study theology. He recognized that the main people in Moral Re-Armament were theologians. He wanted to help the church be authentic in its Christian experience. He followed the call to study theology which he had first received at Caux. However, as he involved himself in university life, he forgot about Moral Re-Armament for about one decade.

Bockmuehl passed the *Abitur* in 1951. From 1951–58 he studied theology and philosophy in Wuppertal, Göttingen, Tübingen, and Basel. At Basel he was invited to Karl Barth's select seminar to study under him. Though he admired Barth as a teacher, he never became a Barthian, since he differed with Barth on certain significant points as he later revealed

in *The Unreal God of Modern Theology*.²⁷ He kept up his personal relationship with Barth when he visited Basel.

Since Bockmuehl had become interested in economics and social studies at Göttingen, he studied also at the London School of Economics. While in England, he seized the chance to read theology at King's College, London. He was awarded the Doctor of Theology degree at the University of Basel in 1959 under Professor Henrik van Oyen with a dissertation on the critique of religion and anthropology in the works of Ludwig Feuerbach and Karl Marx.²⁸

From 1958 to 1961 Bockmuehl was the teaching assistant to Professor Jürgen Moltmann at the Kirchlichen Hochschule in Wuppertal. There he met and fell in love with Elisabeth Becker, a theological student who also studied at the University of Bonn and later at Basel under Karl Barth. She was born and brought up in a home without any Christian nurture, since her father was an atheist. Through the encouragement of her religious studies teacher at school, she investigated the claims of Christianity and experienced religious conversion at the age of eighteen. Despite Bockmuehl's keen commitment to Pietism and Moral Re-Armament, Elisabeth did not know either of these initially. In time she came to see that her faith was supported by these movements. After a civil ceremony the previous day, Klaus Bockmuehl married Elisabeth Becker on 4 March 1961 in the Castle Church of Linnepe, near Hösel, in the North Rhine-Westphalia region of Germany. Shortly thereafter, the *Landeskirche* ordained him to the ministry on 1 August 1961 at the *Christuskirche* in Düren where he served as *Hilfsprediger* (assistant pastor) until 1962. They later had three children—Markus, Anne-Ruth, and Christoph.²⁹

During the period 1958–1961, Bockmuehl had responsibilities for the younger students at Wuppertal, but he did not have answers for the problems they were facing. Although he had not thought of Moral Re-Armament since 1949, he decided in 1959 to go to Caux for answers. Here he attended the performance of 'Hurricane,' a play by Alan Thornhill. After three days there, Bockmuehl wrote to his wife: 'I came to ask how Christian is MRA, I have to ask now how Christian is Klaus Bockmuehl.'

The time at Caux made him reexamine his life. He decided to begin writing to his widowed mother once a week; he thought about the way he had behaved to Moltmann in his classes. Bockmuehl disagreed with his theology. He took delight in demolishing Moltmann's positions during class. He had attempted to destroy Moltmann's seminar. At Caux he felt directed to write Moltmann a letter of apology saying in essence: 'I see what I have done. I am sorry. Please forgive me. I want to be a follower of Christ. I want to be loyal to you. I am no longer a person of career ambition.' When he returned to Wuppertal, Bockmuehl saw Moltmann and asked if he had received his letter. Moltmann indicated that he had not. Since the letter had been delayed in the mail, Bockmuehl stood face to face before Moltmann and asked his pardon. After this, Bockmuehl ceased caring about his career advancement. Instead he sought to please and obey God. He stopped criticizing Moltmann and supported him the last year remaining at Wuppertal.

Moral Re-Armament had a profound impact upon Bockmuehl in the formulation of his early practice of listening to God. He remained in contact with the movement off and on throughout his teaching career. He had done little in his writing career to acknowledge how much he had been influenced by the movement during his late teens and twenties. As he lay dying, he wanted to give credit where credit was due in *Listening to the God Who Speaks* by mentioning his indebtedness to Buchman. His interest in ethics and the Holy Spirit came originally from its leaders. His mentor Karl Barth did not approve of Moral Re-Armament nor did various Evangelical leaders appreciate all of the movement's emphases. While not endorsing everything ever said or done by its leaders, he continued nonetheless through the rest of his life to admire the good it was accomplishing in the lives of individuals, workers, world leaders, and divided nations. He marvelled that much of the inspiration for the activities of its leaders came during times of quiet and listening to God. He wrote: 'Even affecting international politics, people who listened to God were responsible for the initiatives that eventually led to the independence of Morocco; the efforts to reconcile the Greeks and Turks on the island of Cyprus; and to the peaceful development of relationships between

the German- and Italian-speaking populations of south Tyrol/northern Italy' (p. 6).

Medieval Spirituality

Dr. James M. Houston, former Principal of Regent College, once referred to Bockmuehl as 'a Pietist reinforced by the Oxford Group.' While these two movements were extremely influential in the development of his teaching on listening to God, he revealed also his indebtedness to medieval spiritual writers, who provided a corrective to an imbalance in the teaching of Martin Luther and John Calvin when they argued that God did not speak 'immediately' today 'without mediation' to a person (p. 127). His major work *Gesetz und Geist* (*Law and Spirit*) revealed his great admiration for Luther and his stronger identification with Calvin.³⁰ Nevertheless, Bockmuehl believed that these two reformers had developed their views on this subject in reaction to radical spiritual movements of their day in a way that prevented them from affirming the insights of the biblical and medieval writers on the possibility of God speaking directly to an individual in the present.

When Luther wrote cautiously about listening to God, he had in mind Thomas Muntzer, a leader of the militant wing of the Anabaptist movement. Luther stereotyped Muntzer as one of the 'heavenly prophets' who claimed that God talked to him as he spoke with the angels. Claiming divine inspiration, Muntzer had demanded the death of all Roman Catholic priests in the way that Israel had been summoned by Yahweh to smite the Canaanites. Luther rejected these revelations partly because God does not send the Holy Spirit to cause anarchy in existing society. Instead he developed his own theory of how God spoke to people in his day. God worked with people in a twofold manner: 'externally through the preaching of the Word of God and the sacraments and internally through the Holy Spirit.' Bockmuehl summarized Luther's position: 'God does this, however, in such a way that the external means *precede* the internal, so no one receives faith, or the Spirit *without*—only *through*—the Word written and proclaimed.' Accordingly, Luther frowned upon those who claimed that God had spoken immediately to them apart from the Word and Sacraments (pp. 126–7).

John Calvin came to basically the same

position as that of Luther though he wrote more about the Holy Spirit. Calvin feared the 'Spiritualists,' a branch of the Anabaptists, because they neglected or despised Scripture. They offered it to beginners and claimed for themselves a Christian holiness that allowed them 'to rely solely on the illuminations of the Holy Spirit for guidance.' Calvin detected the heresy of immoralism when he learned that they were not under the constraint of God's laws since they claimed to be led by the Holy Spirit. Convinced that they could receive revelations beyond Scripture, the Spiritualists encouraged people to act upon whatever inner thoughts they had without consideration of the moral law. If left unchecked, these Spiritualist Anabaptists would promote anarchy in the social order. In contrast, Calvin based his ethics upon an exposition of the Ten Commandments. 'Calvin felt that as there were no longer oracles or visions from heaven—that the Holy Spirit was exclusively given *through* Scripture—Christians were to meditate on the promises of Scripture and find illumination there' (p. 129). The position of Calvin enhanced the standing of the preacher over that of the individual believer's attempts to understand Scripture in private.

Bockmuehl discovered a difficulty in the Reformation synthesis of Luther and Calvin. The magisterial reformers concluded that 'the Spirit works exclusively through Scripture and must be subjected to the interpretation of an ordained minister.' Their solution was the development of an objective system of thought that believers were to accept without 'the benefit of subjective interaction, decision or experience' (p. 132). The Reformational orthodoxy, Bockmuehl argued, did not 'represent a biblical balance of Scripture and Spirit, objective truth and subjective apprehension.' Furthermore, 'subjectivity undoubtedly is a prerogative of the Christian faith, which affirms a personal God-human relationship and not just subscription to a collectively held package of dogma' (p. 135). The Enlightenment of the eighteenth century philosophers emphasized the subjective at the expense of the objective Word of God. Bockmuehl proposed a challenge to the contemporary church: 'We must go back to the stance held by the Christian faith *before* the split over Reformed orthodoxy and the Enlightenment. We need to recover

a third way, a synthesis, in which what is objectively given, Scripture, is personally accepted through the Holy Spirit (p. 137).' Thus, Bockmuehl favoured the medieval approach to God's guidance.

For example, Bockmuehl remarked how Augustine had heard in the Garden in Milan a voice like that of a child crying: 'Take up and read, take up and read.' Sensing that God was speaking to him, he opened his Bible and found the passage in Romans 13:13–14 that led to his conversion. There were other evidences of God talking to people in Augustine's *Confessions*. His mother Monica received a dream that convinced her Augustine would be converted before her death (p. 194). Clearly, Augustine practiced listening to God. He wrote: 'The man who serves you best is the one who is less intent on hearing from you what he wills to hear than on shaping his will according to what he hears from you' (*Confessions*, 10:26).

Similarly, Bockmuehl found that Bernard of Clairvaux reflected the biblical teaching about listening to God more admirably than that of Calvin or Luther. Bernard affirmed that 'the decisive developments in our lives' as for instance the resolution to become a monk, came about through 'the inner calling of the Holy Spirit.' Bernard described the precise manner that the Holy Spirit communicated to a believer: 'Therefore, when the Spirit thus comes and possesses the soul completely by suggesting, instructing, affecting, he speaks constantly in our thoughts, so that we, too, hear "what God the Lord will speak," by illuminating reason, and igniting the will' (p. 109). The same sense of the immediacy of God's presence was found by Bockmuehl in Patrick, Ansgar, Francis of Assisi, and Thomas à Kempis (pp. 111–17).

Bockmuehl's reading in spirituality was not confined to the medieval period although he referred only to this epoch in his last work. While he was best known as a systematic theologian and ethicist, Bockmuehl made time to read spiritual theology. During his student days he benefited from the devotional insights of Henry Drummond, Oswald Chambers, and Thomas à Kempis. He had a special passion for Charles de Foucauld and commended this Catholic spiritual writer to the evangelical world.³¹ His Pietist favorites included Johann Arndt, P. J. Spener, A. H. Francke, Nikolaus

Ludwig von Zinzendorf, and Gerhard Tersteegen. William Wilberforce and John Wesley were especially prized among Evangelical writers. For inspiration he turned throughout life to biographies of the great saints of the church.

Although he read widely in different spiritual traditions, he studied all of these sources critically in light of 1 Thessalonians 5:21: 'But test everything; hold fast what is good, abstain from every form of evil.' James Houston claimed that Bockmuehl was 'a lone voice against Liberalism and Marxism in Europe. He was a great apologist against atheism and saw much contemporary theology as atheism in its nakedness.' Houston concluded: 'Bockmuehl was an astute theologian who could smell heresies. He was a theological watchdog.'³² 'Scrupulous integrity and care for . . . the cause of God and the millions enmeshed in liberal theology and Marxist ideology—marked all that he did,' wrote James I. Packer.³³ His leadership in the worldwide evangelical renaissance of the late twentieth century was recognized when he was called upon to serve as a contributing editor of *Christianity Today* and a member of the Theology Commission of the World Evangelical Fellowship. Carl F. H. Henry, termed Bockmuehl 'a devout man of God' and 'an intellectually gifted warrior for Christ and the evangelical cause.'³⁴

With a discerning spirit, Bockmuehl benefited from the inspiration he had received from the Pietist, Moral Re-Armament, and medieval theologians when it came to developing a rationale for listening to God. He found help from these streams rather than from the writings of Luther and Calvin on this subject, because they seemed closer to the teaching of the writers of the Old and New Testaments. These three sources of his piety marked his lectures, sermons, books, discussion groups, and counselling sessions. Pietism, Moral Re-Armament, and Medieval Spirituality consistently inspired him to proceed with a daily devotional hour with God and challenged him in family, church, and college life, beginning in the formative years of his youth and continuing to the day of death.

II. His Practice Of Discerning The God Who Speaks

In his last work *Listening to the God Who Speaks* Klaus Bockmuehl made an important contribution to that discipline of spirituality called the 'discernment of spirits.' From biblical times Christians have been taught to expect to 'be guided by the Spirit' (Galatians 5:18; Romans 8:14). Spiritual writers like Ignatius Loyola and Jonathan Edwards have urged the importance of determining if their inner direction had a divine, human, or demonic source. Christians frequently inquire of God hundreds of times: 'Should I marry this person? Should I attend this particular school? What career should I follow?' They often ask: 'Is this the will of God for me? How do I discern the will of God? Can God speak to me today?' Bockmuehl believed that believers might discern the divine will as God speaks through Word and Spirit.³⁵ He tried to assist Christians to discern what God might be saying to them during their devotional times of scriptural meditation and prayerful listening by indicating a host of ways in which God guides believers. Because meditation upon Scripture comprised a large part of his listening process, he avoided the pitfalls of those who have claimed heavenly direction when in fact they were being led in directions contrary to biblical teaching.

By use of biblical, historical, and theological arguments, Bockmuehl has shown that God addresses those who listen to him. Unfortunately, Bockmuehl did not provide readers with illustrations from his own experiences of discerning God's will through listening. This section will provide this missing autobiographical ingredient by providing the principles he gained from Bible study on hearing God and indicate their application during major events of his life from 1961 until his death in 1989.

Bockmuehl's spirituality follows the evangelical way of meditation with its insistence that the surest approach to meeting God and contemplating the divine attributes is through meditating on Scripture. He agrees fully with other evangelicals that the most devout inquirers after God should begin with Holy Scripture and allow the Spirit of

the ascended Christ to lead them onward in communion with God. However, Bockmuehl goes a step further than many Protestants by teaching that believers can sense what God is calling them to do if they are faithful in their meditative study of Scripture and prayerful seeking of God's will. God's direction can become plain to them including which specific sins to forsake, what stands to make on behalf of God's truth, what ministries to undertake, what books and talks to prepare, what comfort to assist them through affliction, and what duties to perform in family and society. In the context of prayerful listening, Bockmuehl found that insights and ideas came to him that he did not gain through reason alone. The events of Bockmuehl's life will illustrate how he sensed God's pleasure in the actions he took as he regularly sought to discern God's will and plan for his life.

Bockmuehl wanted his devotional life to move beyond just a discursive meditation on Scripture by which its original meaning is applied to one's life. While favouring meditation and prayer over a sacred text, Bockmuehl also seeks the experience of what others call contemplation. Peter Toon defines contemplation as 'the loving attention of the whole soul upon God in a simple way.' Toon differentiates between meditation or mental prayer as 'the activity of the mind, heart, and will before the Lord, seeking to draw near to him and do his will' on the one hand and contemplation as 'a higher stage of being raised (by the Holy Spirit) into a simple, loving attention to God.'³⁶ During Bockmuehl's last years, he grew in this contemplative dimension of prayer. He taught that we can love God directly and experience a sense of God's love. He recorded these perceptions of divine love in journal entries when he had less than a year to live. His journaling reflects a heartfelt or 'experimental' acquaintance with God so characteristic of Pietist devotion and a contemplative delight in God favored by medieval spiritual writers. Life experiences remembered by his widow Elisabeth and recorded in his journals illustrate the biblical principles Bockmuehl had discovered about listening to the God who speaks. The biblical approaches to listening embodied in Bockmuehl's life

included the following characteristics: regularity, cleansing of sin, direction about plans through inner inspiration, guidance in personal affliction, and love of God and neighbour.

With Regularity

Bockmuehl followed the biblical recommendation of seeking God regularly for knowledge of the divine will and a sense of God's presence. Following his conversion and thereafter, serious study of Scripture became a way of life for Bockmuehl. He not only studied the Bible devotionally but also received extensive training in biblical exegesis under world-renowned Old Testament scholars such as Hans Walter Wolff at Wuppertal and Walter Eichrodt at Basel. He brought sharp exegetical skills to all of his theology and personal meditations. It will be important therefore, to examine the biblical evidence for Bockmuehl's thesis that 'when people listen, God speaks.' Pietism, Moral Re-Armament, and Medieval spirituality had all directed him to the Bible as the place where he would most clearly hear from God. Modelling himself after the leaders of these movements, he saturated himself in Scripture study. He personally applied the principles he had derived from Scripture during times of crisis and decision.

A very disciplined man, Bockmuehl cited Isaiah to illustrate the importance of listening to God regularly at the break of dawn: 'The Lord God . . . awakens me morning by morning, awakens my ear to hear as those who are taught. The Lord God has opened my ear; and I was not rebellious, nor did I turn away' (Isaiah. 50:4-5). Bockmuehl noted, that Isaiah finds that 'God awakens him from sleep so that he is ready to hear what God has to say.' Dismissing the claims of those who maintained that a regular time of listening was 'legalistic', Bockmuehl reminded us that 'they regularly sit down to dinner to feed their body, however, without raising the same objection.' Moreover, he maintained emphatically that 'if you are a disciple,' then 'you listen devotedly, morning by morning' (p. 25).

Bockmuehl agreed with the psalmist that morning was the 'preferred time for prayer and petition for God's response.' He quoted

the psalter: 'My voice You shall hear in the morning, O LORD; in the morning I will direct it to you, and I will look up' (Psalms 5:3). 'To be sure, God can also speak in the night—and the psalmist is not adverse to beleaguering God's throne with prayer all through the day,' Bockmuehl remarked, but 'the psalmist appears to suggest the morning hour as the appropriate time' to seek the face of God (p. 42).

Not only did Bockmuehl personally follow these counsels every day but also he found that the realities of his schedule demanded this. The time between five and six o'clock in the morning worked best for him, because he could be relatively free from interferences from his children at that sacred hour with God. Unlike some Christians with haphazard devotional practices, he did not attempt this practice only a few days a week. He met God each day at that hour unless hindered by illness. James I. Packer described seeing Bockmuehl in action when they shared the same motel room at a conference: 'I sat on my bed for morning devotions, but Klaus went to the table and wrote, evidently the old Oxford Group/Moral Re-Armament discipline of putting on paper all that God seemed to say in, through, and *a propos* of the Scriptures that one read in one's Quiet Time.'³⁷

When at home, his routine consisted of rising at five, followed by showering, shaving, and dressing. After a quick cup of tea, he had one hour alone with God. He read Scripture until he found one verse that spoke to him profoundly. He wrote that down in his journal. Then he meditated upon its meaning and listened to God for insights. Sometimes he recorded profound thoughts about Scripture that he later incorporated into his books. He jotted down inspired ideas and plans that came to him in this quiet hour. Some of his thoughts were as mundane as 'play with Markus' or as spiritual as 'read more Bible stories to the children.' He normally concluded with lengthy intercessions for family and friends. For example, during his last illness his journal reveals his prayers for James M. Houston: 'Also to spiritually support Jim H., as if I were his base camp. Pray for his lectures' (February 14, 1989).

For Cleansing

During these regular times of Bible reading, Bockmuehl felt directed by God to repent of sins in his life. As a professor of Christian ethics, he taught the relevance of the Ten Commandments for today. He noted: 'The Ten Commandments are thus the foundational statute for a people living with God, guidelines for those who will live under his kingship and in communion with him.' The decalogue specifies 'the limits of this fellowship,' and it is 'the framework for God's more specific instruction in the future' (p. 16). Listening to Scripture made Bockmuehl acutely aware of areas needing attention in his life.

He cited Isaiah, 'I am the LORD your God who teaches you to profit, who leads you by the way you should go' (Isaiah. 48:17). Bockmuehl commented, 'As always, the prophet of Israel is concerned not with insights into some heavenly mysteries, but with the way we should live here on earth.' He emphasized: 'Experiencing God's guidance has a cleansing effect' (p. 27). As previously mentioned in part one, Bockmuehl received guidance from God at Caux to humble himself before Moltmann and ask his forgiveness. This became a practice of Bockmuehl throughout life. He continually received conviction of sin during his times of reading Scripture and listening to God. He was not too proud to go and ask for some one's forgiveness. Sometimes when a relationship was strained with a friend or colleague and the fault lay primarily with the other person, Bockmuehl would feel guided to seek reconciliation by asking the other to forgive him for the little he may have done wrong.

Bockmuehl knew that cleansing from sin was a precondition for hearing God clearly. 'Jeremiah and Ezekiel both point out, however, that this comprehensive inner change, which is the key to God's guidance, must be preceded by forgiveness and cleansing.' He continued: 'Through forgiveness and cleansing, the determining power of a destructive past is put to an end. The freedom that was forfeited is restored, and the people can be attentive to and available for the directions of the Lord' (p. 29).

He also stressed that another condition for receiving God's guidance was the fulfilment of our 'duty toward our needy neighbor. Isaiah 58, the famous social-ethics chapter and the forerunner to Jesus' enumeration of the "six

bodily works of mercy" (Matt. 25:31–46), states, "when you see the naked . . . cover him, . . . then you shall call, and the Lord will answer . . . If you extend your soul to the hungry and satisfy the afflicted soul . . . the Lord will guide you continually" (Isaiah. 58:7–10).' With reference to this passage Bockmuehl maintained that the promise of divine direction was contingent upon our love of neighbour (p. 28).

Under Orders

Bockmuehl's desire to live 'under orders' to Jesus Christ was another aspect of the ethical nature of his spirituality that stressed cleansing from sin. As one who belonged to both the Reformed and Lutheran traditions, Bockmuehl inherited John Calvin's teaching on 'the third use of the law.' Calvin believed that the law was to reveal the will of God to those who believed and to assist them in determining right actions in society. Consequently, the Reformed churches have placed a greater emphasis on sanctification than most Lutherans with the exception of the Lutheran Pietists.³⁸

Shaped by both the Reformed and Lutheran Pietist heritage, Bockmuehl delighted in obeying what he felt God was calling him to do. Whether it was to write a book or to take a stand on some moral issue, Bockmuehl went forward with a quiet confidence because he tried to do God's will. He did not attempt to decide if an action were politically correct or advantageous for his career advancement before attempting it. He sought to do what he felt God through Scripture was asking of him. He wrote: 'The early believers who lived the Christian life and spread the gospel of God's kingdom lived *under orders*.' Moreover, 'their work for God was not self-designed,' he remarked, rather 'the punctuality of the disciples' obedience, which shines through the narrative, shows that Jesus remained in command of the details.' The New Testament Church received orders from the Holy Spirit, which its members obeyed promptly. These early disciples did not make plans for the Lord's work, for he reasoned: 'The Book of Acts made clear that planning expressly falls under the department and competence of the Holy Spirit' (p. 79).

Klaus Bockmuehl never undertook any venture in life without a great deal of prayer. He

would not consent to a speaking engagement or writing assignment until he had sought God's wisdom during his morning Quiet Time. After prayerful consideration, he decided that he should accept the invitation of Professor Henrik van Oyen of the University of Basel to assist him with research he was doing for a history of ethics. This would permit Bockmuehl time in Basel to write his *Habilitation*.

Bockmuehl felt directed to become involved in a disputation over homosexuality at Basel, since his exegesis of Scripture forced him to the conclusion that sexual relations between homosexuals violated the law of God. His active part in this controversy would eventually cost him an appointment in a prestigious Swiss university. During the period 1964–1965, Dr. Theo Bovet, a specialist in marriage counseling, asserted that the church should accept homosexual practice and offer homosexuals a chance to marry each other. Bockmuehl and some of his friends had spoken privately to Bovet to urge him to abandon this position. When he did not, Bockmuehl helped his Swiss friends to compose a report concerning this matter in which they urged that sexual relations should be confined to heterosexual marriage. They sent their study to the Church government begging officials in Basel to hinder Bovet from carrying out his dreams. By detective work, the newspaper discovered that Bockmuehl was one of its authors. Due to the controversy surrounding Bockmuehl's involvement, he became a *persona non grata* with the faculty. Consequently his professor chose not to accept his *Habilitation*. This closed the door for any possibility of teaching in a state university. Despite this disappointment, he was asked in 1965 to teach part time at a Pietist theological school in Basel called the *Prediger-und Missionsseminar* St. Chrischona. In 1965 he left Basel and became a student pastor at the University of Heidelberg.

While in Heidelberg, Bockmuehl encountered opposition from a student movement on campus called *Evangelische Studenten-Gemeinde in Deutschland*. As student pastor of the *Landeskirche*, Bockmuehl ministered directly to students in this group. During this time of student revolt, the movement had become very sympathetic to Marxism. Bockmuehl had publicly criticized Marxist views in student meetings at the University. This displeased

many of them. The leaders of the movement asked Bockmuehl to resign. He responded that he would have to pray to the Lord about it. They warned that he should comply with their wishes. Bockmuehl spent a day praying about it and counting the cost of such a decision. After much prayer, he thought he was meant to remain. He informed the leaders that he would not leave so they could have their man appointed in his place.

On the night of January 24, 1968 the *Evangelische Studenten-Gemeinde* called a meeting at their Assembly House for the purpose of bringing charges against Bockmuehl. They invited members of the press to cover the meeting in the hopes that the newspapers would present their disapproval of Bockmuehl. At this meeting members of the *Evangelische Studenten-Mission in Deutschland* arose to defend Bockmuehl. Previously this group had been unconcerned about political and social issues. Their defence showed what was being done to injure Bockmuehl's reputation. Reporters interviewed him for his side of the story. They released a full-page article exposing the design of the E.S.G. and vindicating Bockmuehl.

After this, the bishop wanted him either to remain as student pastor at the university or to become pastor of a prestigious congregation in Heidelberg. After he had stood his ground and cleared his name, Bockmuehl felt that it was time to leave. With all of the controversy he did not see how he could minister successfully to all groups on campus. He asked the bishop to place him in a small parish so he would have time to work on a book. The bishop consented and sent him to a quiet pastorate in Schmieheim bei Lahr in the Black Forest of Germany (1968–71). After this restful time, he returned to St. Chrischona to teach systematic theology full-time from 1971 to 1977. Perhaps Bockmuehl may have had his experience in Heidelberg in mind when he wrote about Paul in *Listening to the God Who Speaks*: 'This instruction, as we have seen, sometimes means leaving a city because of, or staying in a city in spite of, mounting resistance.' He concluded: 'Neither persecution nor success, in human eyes, are decisive; only the instructions received from the Lord' (p. 80).

For Direction about Plans through Inner Inspiration

Bockmuehl believed that God spoke, taught, and led through 'an inner inspiration.' The psalmist spoke of God's guidance: 'I will instruct you and teach you the way you should go; I will counsel you with my eyes upon you' (Ps. 32:8). 'The verse is a promise for the "walk" of believers: it is not for the sedentary, but for those on the way.' Bockmuehl noted: 'It is not for pilgrims who know their destination, but for those who may need concrete instructions on which road to follow' (p. 37).

Elisabeth Bockmuehl claimed that her husband's creative ideas for his articles and books often came to him during his morning hour of listening to God through Scripture reading. He recorded his meditations on Scripture and incorporated them into his books. Each book resulted partly from inner insights from God that beckoned him to address a particular theological theme. His Regent College students found evidence of his approach, for he shared these insights when he taught them. He normally began his classes at the college by pulling out his small notebook from which he read the thoughts that had come to him from his Bible reading. In this way he provided a model for his students of one who made future plans within the context of listening and praying.

One of the major decisions of his life required careful discernment of God's will. Bockmuehl had to determine if God could be calling him to move from St. Chrischona, where he and his family had been very happy, to teach in Regent College far away in Canada. John Stott had originally recommended him for the professorship of systematic theology and ethics at this newly-founded Evangelical graduate school of theology. If Bockmuehl accepted, this meant a new language and a new culture for his whole family. His journal recorded the way he sought guidance on this matter. On December 23, 1976 he received a telephone call from Dr. James Houston, the principal of the college. On December 26 he wrote regarding Vancouver, 'Travel lightly. It is for Jesus to decide where my work should go on and to let me know by his Spirit. There is certainty that I may be under His guidance in a far away country in Egypt.' An entry for January 1977 revealed his thoughts in the context of his prayer: 'I do not disengage lightly from Chrischona. It is neces-

sary to be thrown out of the Evangelical milieu in a small party sense. A tentative yes to Vancouver. There will be full clarity. Never expect God to speak on command.' He continued, 'Everywhere, Abraham first built an altar. We need an altar in our lives! Obedience for departure.' With prayerful surrender, he wrote, 'I seek the will of the Father.'

When he went to Regent to speak and to talk with the officials in February 1977, he preserved his reaction in his journal: 'Do not speculate at the outcome of this. Do not take the decision out of God's hands. And particularly, you must not allow yourself to be led by fear (nor by ambition).' When the college offered him an invitation to become a professor in 1977, he sensed that this was God's call to this new avenue of service in light of the insights he had received in prayer previously. Once he had arrived, he loved Regent College—the students, professors, fellowship, and spirit of the place. Whenever he made a decision informed by prayer, he never had second thoughts. He felt that it was right to make a decision (guided by God) and kill the alternative. He did not debate back and forth as to what he should do. He kept praying until he had clarity about what duty directed. Then he moved forward with a quiet confidence from which he could not be shaken.

For Guidance in Personal Affliction

Guidance came to Bockmuehl not only when he was forming future plans but also during the dark days of life. He explained the meaning of 2 Corinthians 12:7–9 as an example of how God had guided Paul in the midst of his personal affliction. Paul wrote:

Lest I should be exalted above measure by the abundance of revelations [I received], a thorn in the flesh [perhaps some illness or physical handicap?] was given to me . . . Concerning this thing I pleaded with the lord three times that it might depart from me. And he said to me: My grace is sufficient for you, for My strength is made perfect in [human] weakness.

With his own terminal cancer in mind, Bockmuehl described how Paul found not only comfort in pain but also a strength to bear pain's disconcerting side effects. Moreover, this pain brought a 'divinely ordained identity' Bockmuehl remarked, and, 'beyond that, an understanding and acceptance of

his current situation—so much so that he even preferred it to his previous condition!' Bockmuehl concluded: 'Paul's moment of crisis was the door to the revelation of a privilege. That the Lord spoke to him showed he had not been left by the wayside, apparently incapacitated, but continued to be at the very heart of the outworking of God's historic purposes' (p. 92).

In 1985 the doctor detected cancer and scheduled surgery for Bockmuehl on June 7. His journal entries dealt with his fear and the way God helped him to 'trust in the goodness of the Lord.' He gained comfort in the words of Rita Houston: 'We know that we do not have to go alone through the dark valley. Only He had to, so that we wouldn't. He will be with us.' The successful outcome of this surgery gave him the chance to continue teaching and writing for four more years.

Shortly before learning of his cancerous condition, Bockmuehl received notification that a group of evangelicals had established a *Stiftungsprofessor*, or an endowed chair of theology at the University of Basel, with the intention of having him as its first professor. This would have placed this significant evangelical theologian in an important university where Karl Barth had taught, but Bockmuehl's illness made this impossible. He declined to be considered and continued to teach at Regent surrounded by many friends who would support him during his last years of life. He loved the community at Regent and did not want to leave it.

On October 3, 1988 his physician phoned him that he had terminal cancer. When he got the sad news, he chose to lay aside work on *Introduction to Christian Ethics*. With only months to live, he sought to pass on to future generations insights he had gained from his meditative life. He prayed for strength to write *Listening to the God Who Speaks*. He jotted down in his journal on October 20: 'God's guidance means to know how we should act in the midst of affliction. The worst thing would be to be without God's guidance.' He resolved: 'Listen twice as much as you talk.' Despite his sickness, he continued his time of listening. In these times he found grace to go on with writing this book and teaching at Regent College.

For Love for God and Neighbour

Especially as he faced the prospect of the pain of cancer, Klaus Bockmuehl returned to the heart of his ethics and spirituality. This was, according to his widow, the great commandment of Jesus to love God and neighbour (Matthew 22:34–40). He rejected the teaching of Martin Luther that ‘we cannot love God in his majesty; we must love God in his creatures.’ Luther maintained that God could be loved in the person of our neighbour but ‘not directly, without intermediary.’ On the other hand, Bockmuehl believed that God could be loved directly and passionately with heart, soul, and mind. ‘Love expresses itself firstly in joy over the beloved.’ He continued: ‘The loving soul . . . has a real passion for its object . . . To “love God with all your soul” means to think of him at night and in the morning (Psalm 63:6).’ The psalmist expressed this kind of love for God when he wrote, ‘As the deer pants for the waterbrooks, so pants my soul for you, O God’ (Psalm 42:1). One had to go to Roman Catholic spirituality, Bockmuehl noted, for help on loving God, because modern Protestant theology seemed united, with only a few exceptions, in stating that ‘God can only be loved in the person of our neighbour.’³⁹

Through his rich devotional life, Bockmuehl sought to enter this heartfelt love relationship with God in a contemplative manner. The entries in his journal during his last months spoke much of loving God and receiving God’s love. ‘Moment by moment I am kept in His Love,’ he inscribed in his entry for December 11. He continued: ‘Knowing God’s will is knowing God’s love, because His will is His loving will for us.’ On Valentine’s Day 1989 he jotted down in his journal: ‘I still need to creep out of the chrysalis of my former theological existence and take on the wings of love of God and love of neighbour, the gifts of the Holy Spirit.’ As he grew weaker he discovered: “Let us be listeners” is the first step to “let us be lovers”’ (April 1). In his final book, Bockmuehl expressed his deep conviction that one of the simplest criteria for testing the Lord’s present instruction is love. ‘Where the Holy Spirit is, there is love, because he pours the love of God and of neighbour into our hearts

. . . Love in action is proof of the presence of the Spirit’ (p. 98).

During Klaus Bockmuehl’s final illness, he experienced his first spiritual friendship of any depth outside that of his wife Elisabeth. Though he had dutifully sought throughout life to love his neighbour, he was invited into a new adventure of friendship with an esteemed colleague. James Houston visited him once every day. Bockmuehl had had friends previously, but the demands of his teaching career had made the development of a friendship on this level impossible. He had kept busy preparing lectures, writing books, and providing spiritual guidance to his students. Now sickness made him ready for sharing on a richer level with a good friend.

As professor of spirituality, Houston devoured the devotional classics. One day Houston gave the dying Bockmuehl a hazelnut. When Bockmuehl did not understand the significance immediately, Houston reminded him of the passage about the hazelnut in *Revelations of Divine Love* by Julian of Norwich, a fourteenth-century English mystic, that Bockmuehl had previously read. In a vision the Lord showed Julian a ‘little thing the size of a hazelnut lying’ in the palm of her hand. After looking at it, she asked the Lord, ‘What can this be?’ The Lord replied to her, ‘It is everything that is made.’ An answer came to her understanding:

In this little thing, I saw three properties. The first is that God made it. The second is that God loves it. The third is that God keeps it. But I cannot tell the reality of him who is my maker, lover and keeper, for until I am united to him in substance, I may never have complete rest or real bliss, that is, until I am so fastened to him that there is absolutely no created thing between my God and me.⁴⁰

Bockmuehl cherished the hazelnut James Houston had presented him, because it reminded him of what it symbolized to Julian of Norwich: ‘God made it,’ ‘God loves it,’ and ‘God keeps it.’ As Bockmuehl was dying, he saw that he was that hazelnut in God’s hand and that God was calling him into a deeper contemplation of divine love. Bockmuehl kept this hazelnut with him at all times during his last illness to remember

God's love and his friendship with James Houston. After his death, Houston recalled that the hazelnut was found cracked in his bed: 'It had cracked as he held it daily through the pain, yet the simple symbol had comforted him that the God of the hazelnut was his God too.'⁴¹

On June 10, 1989 Klaus Bockmuehl died. Houston recalled that almost his last words were 'hold Jesus dear,' 'act out of being quiet,' and 'listen to the God who speaks.'⁴² 'Hold Jesus dear' spoke of the sum of his ethical teaching on the great Commandment of Jesus (Matthew 22:34-40) that he took with him to the end. 'Act out of being quiet' reminded family and friends that times of silence must precede any serious encounter with God. 'Listen to the God who speaks' informed them with his dying breaths that his thesis was indeed true: 'when people listen, God speaks.' Final words in the closing days of life reveal what is most important. Despite all of the brilliant insights in his theological works, this emphasis upon listening to God was the secret of his spirituality that he most desired to pass on to succeeding generations. He summed up its essence on January 31, 1989: 'Quiet pursuit of prayer and listening to the God who speaks; simplify your life for these: spirituality is the crown of theology.'

- 1 Dr. Thomas is adjunct instructor in church history at Wesley Theological Seminary, Washington, D.C. See Klaus Bockmuehl, *Living by the Gospel: Christian Roots of Confidence and Purpose* (Colorado Springs, CO: Helmers and Howard, 1986), 44-49.
- 2 Klaus Bockmuehl, *Listening to the God Who Speaks* (Colorado Springs: Helmers and Howard, 1990), 9. The German edition is *Hören auf den Gott, der redet* (Giessen, 1990).
- 3 James I. Packer, ed., *The Best in Theology* (Carol Stream, Illinois: Christianity Today, Inc., 1990), vol. 4. For other appreciations of Bockmuehl after his death, see: J. I. Packer, 'Klaus Bockmuehl's Rich Legacy', *Christianity Today*, February 19, 1990; James M. Houston, 'In Memory of Klaus Bockmuehl (1931-89)', *Crux* 25 (June 1989): 2; Klaus Haacker, 'In Memoriam Klaus Bockmuehl', *Theologische Beiträge* 20 (August 1989): 169-70; Helmut Burkhardt, 'Gott ehren mit Dank. Erinnerung an K. Bockmuehl',

Arbeitskreis für evangelikale Theologie (in Verbindung mit der Deutschen Evangelischen Allianz), November 1989, 1-2, 7; Lord Stuart Blanch [formerly Archbishop of York, 1975-1983], Review of *Living by the Gospel* and *Listening to the God Who Speaks*, *European Christian Booksellers' Review*, June 1990; 'In Memoriam, Klaus Bockmuehl', *Quarterly, Christian Legal Society*, Summer 1989.

- 4 Werner Neuer, 'Für eine Theologie aus Liebe zu Gott: Prof. Klaus Bockmuehl: Die Autorität der Bibel anerkennen', *Idea*, June 14, 1989.
- 5 Markus Bockmuehl and Helmut Burkhardt, 'Preface', in *Gott Lieben Und Seine Gebote Halten, Loving God and Keeping His Commandments In Memoriam Klaus Bockmuehl*, edited by Markus Bockmuehl and Helmut Burkhardt, p. 7 (Giessen: Brunnen Verlag, 1991).
- 6 This article has been based on a series of interviews with Elisabeth Bockmuehl, the widow of the subject, in October and November 1992 in Vancouver, British Columbia, Canada. The writer has had the unusual opportunity of speaking with her at length, since he rented her basement apartment. Where there are no sources cited in footnotes for biographical statements, the reader should assume that the information was supplied by Mrs. Bockmuehl. She has also read and verified the information included here and made available selected journals and papers belonging to Dr. Bockmuehl. The bulk of Bockmuehl's papers have already been deposited in the Archives of the *Prediger-und Missionsseminar* St. Chrischona in Basel, Switzerland. Thus the writer was not able to study the materials in Switzerland in order to provide documentation for each statement made by Mrs. Bockmuehl. The dates of some events have been based upon journals or appointment books still in the possession of Mrs. Bockmuehl.
- 7 Peter C. Erb, ed., *The Pietists: Selected Writings* (New York: Paulist Press, 1983), xiii; Justo L. Gonzalez, *The Story of Christianity*, 2 vols. (New York: Harper and Row, 1985), 2:205-6.
- 8 James I. Packer, *The Best in Theology* (Carol Stream, Illinois: Christianity Today, Inc., 1990), vol. 4.; James I. Packer, 'Introduction,' (typescript), sent to Elisabeth Bockmuehl.
- 9 Ted Campbell, *The Religion of the Heart: A Study of European Religious Life in the Seventeenth and Eighteenth Centuries* (Columbia, S.C.: University of South Carolina Press, 1991), 2-3; F. Ernest Stoeffler, *Rise of Evangelical Pietism* (Leiden, 1965), 33ff; and his 'Pietism—Its Message, Early Manifestation, and Significance', *The Covenant Quarterly* 34:3-24; Dale Brown, *Understanding Pietism* (Grand Rapids: William Eerdmans, 1978); Gary R. Sattler, *God's Glory*,

- Neighbor's Good: A Brief Introduction to the Life and Writings of August Hermann Francke* (Chicago: Covenant Press, 1984); Jaroslav Pelikan, *From Luther to Kierkegaard* (St. Louis: Concordia Publishing House, 1950), 57–66.
- 10 Wilhelm Busch, *Plaudereien in meinem Studierzimmer* (Gladbeck, Westfalen, Germany: Schriftenmissions-Verlag, 1965; Wilhelm Busch, *Johannes Busch: Ein Botschafter Jesu Christi* (Wuppertal, Germany: Aussat-Verlag, 1956).
- 11 Gonzalez, 2:365; information supplied by Elizabeth Bockmuehl on Wilhelm Busch's involvement in the Confessing Church.
- 12 August Hermann Francke, 'The Doctrine of Our Lord Jesus Christ Concerning Rebirth, 1697,' Reprinted in full in Gary R. Sattler, *God's Glory, Neighbor's Good: A Brief Introduction to the Life and Writings of August Hermann Francke* (Chicago: Covenant Press, 1982), 134.
- 13 Klaus Bockmuehl, 'Legacy of Pietism and Methodism' in 'Christian Doctrine of the Church' tape series, Regent College Library, Vancouver, BC.
- 14 Klaus Bockmuehl, *Die Aktualität des Pietismus* (Basel: Brunnen Verlag, 1985). This has not been translated into English. See also his other work—*Die Stellung des Pietismus zur Separation*, Gnadauer Materialdienst, Nr. 3 (Denkendorf, 1976).
- 15 Bockmuehl, lecture on tape.
- 16 August Hermann Francke, 'Short Course of Instructions on How Holy Scripture Ought to Be Read for One's True Edification,' translated by Manfred W. Fleischmann, *Crux* 25 (March 1989): 2–4. Fleischmann translated the text, showed it to Bockmuehl. Later Bockmuehl requested permission from Fleischmann to publish it.
- 17 *New 20th-Century Encyclopedia of Religious Knowledge*, edited by J. D. Douglas, second edition, (Grand Rapids: Baker Book House, 1991), s.v., 'Buchman, Frank Nathan Daniel,' 126–7.
- 18 Garth Lean, *Frank Buchman: A Life* (London: Constable, 1985), 35–36, 74.
- 19 Frank N. D. Buchman, *Remaking the World* (London: Blandford, 1947), 24, quoted in Bockmuehl, *Listening*, 8.
- 20 These were first developed by Robert Elliott Speer, the famous Presbyterian mission statesman for whom the library at Princeton Theological Seminary is named. Robert E. Speer, *The Principles of Jesus: Applied to Some Questions of Today* (New York: Fleming H. Revell, 1902), 35; *What Is the Oxford Group* (London: Oxford University Press, 1933), 7.
- 21 Bockmuehl to Lean, quoted in Lean, 513–14. See also Klaus Bockmuehl, *Frank Buchmans Botschaft und ihre Bedeutung für die protestantischen Kirchen* (Bern, 1963). 43 pp.
- 22 Alan Thornhill, *The Forgotten Factor* (London: Blandford Press, 1954).
- 23 Lean, 358–59, 292–93.
- 24 Lean, 362; interview with Elizabeth Bockmuehl.
- 25 Böckler quoted in Lean, 361.
- 26 Klaus Bockmuehl, *The Challenge of Marxism: A Christian Response* (Downers Grove, Ill.: InterVarsity Press, 1980). For the German edition, see *Herausforderungen des Marxismus* (Giessen and Basel: Brunnen Verlag, 1979). See also his *Evangelicals and Social Ethics: A Commentary on Article 5 of the Lausanne Covenant* (Downers Grove, Ill.: InterVarsity Press, 1979).
- 27 Klaus Bockmuehl, *The Unreal God of Modern Theology* (Colorado Springs, CO: Helmers and Howard, 1988). The German edition is *Atheismus in der Christenheit. Die Unwirklichkeit Gottes in Theologie und Kirche*, 3rd ed. (Giessen and Basel: Brunnen-Verlag, 1985).
- 28 Klaus Bockmuehl, *Leiblichkeit und Gesellschaft. Studien zur Religionskritik und Anthropologie im Frühwerk von Ludwig Feuerbach und Karl Marx* (Göttingen, 1961).
- 29 Markus is currently Lecturer at the Faculty of Divinity in the University of Cambridge, England; Anne-Ruth is a home maker since her marriage to Rupert Eschenlohr of Winterthur, Switzerland; and Christoph is a physician in Calgary, Alberta, Canada and is married to Leslie Todd. Elisabeth currently is Alumni Director at Regent College and occasional lecturer at the Prediger-und Missionsseminar, St. Chrischona in Basel, Switzerland.
- 30 Klaus Bockmuehl, *Gesetz und Geist: Eine Kritische Würdigung des Erbes protestantischer Ethik* (Law and Spirit: A Critical Appreciation of the Inheritance of Protestant Ethics) (Basel: Brunnen Verlag, 1987). Only his first volume was published prior to his death.
- 31 Klaus Bockmuehl, 'Saint for Our Day: Charles de Foucauld,' *Christianity Today*, January 5, 1979.
- 32 Interview with James M. Houston, October 29, 1992.
- 33 Packer, *Best in Theology*, vol. 4.
- 34 Carl F. H. Henry to Arthur D. Thomas, Jr., September 6, 1992.
- 35 Michael Downey, ed., *The New Dictionary of Catholic Spirituality* (Collegeville, MN: Liturgical Press, 1993), s.v., 'Discernment of Spirits,' by Michael J. Buckley, 275–81; Jordan Aumann, *Spiritual Theology* (London: Sheed and Ward, 1980), 339–441; Jonathan Edwards, *Religious Affections*, ed. John E. Smith (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1959); Michael J. Buckley, 'The Structure of the Rules for Discernment of Spirits,' in *Spiritual Exercises: Collected Essays*, ed. P. Sheldrake (London: SPCK, 1990).

- 36 Peter Toon, *From Mind to Heart: Christian Meditation Today* (Grand Rapids: Baker Book House, 1987), 71.
- 37 J. I. Packer, *Best in Theology* (Carol Stream, Ill: Christianity Today, Inc., 1990), copied from a typescript of the article sent to Elisabeth Bockmuehl in 1990.
- 38 Howard L. Rice, *Reformed Spirituality* (Louisville: Westminster Press, 1991); R. H. Ramey, Jr. and Ben C. Johnson, *Living the Christian Life: A Guide to Reformed Spirituality* (Louisville: Westminster/John Knox Press, 1992); T. Hartley Hall, 'The Shape of Reformed Piety,' in *Spiritual Traditions for the Contemporary Church*, eds. Robin Maas and Gabriel O'Donnell (Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1990), 202-21; John Calvin, *Institutes of the Christian Religion*, 2. 7. 12.
- 39 Klaus Bockmuehl, 'The Great Commandment,' in *With Heart, Mind and Strength: The Best of Crux, 1979-1989*, ed. Donald M. Lewis (Langley, B.C.: Credo Publishing Corporation, 1990), 1:13.
- 40 Julian of Norwich, *Revelations of Divine Love*, trans. M. L. del Mastro (Garden City, NY: Image Books, 1977), chapter 5.
- 41 James M. Houston, *The Heart's Desire: A Guide to Personal Fulfilment* (Oxford: A Lion Book, 1992), 40. Interview with James Houston, Vancouver, British Columbia, November 1992.
- 42 James M. Houston, 'In Memory of Klaus Bockmuehl' (1931-89), *Crux* 25 (June 1989): 2.