

John—Evangelist and Interpreter
S. Smalley

Carlisle: Paternoster Press, 1998 (2nd ed.), xviii + 340 pp, ISBN 0 85364 823 9

ZUSAMMENFASSUNG

20 Jahre nach dem Erscheinen der ersten Auflage präsentiert Smalley eine komplett überarbeitete Neuauflage seines weitverbreiteten Werkes. Der äußere Anschein (zehn anstelle von sechs Kapiteln, 340 anstelle von 285 Seiten, rund 175 neue bibliographische Einträge, ein in der ersten Auflage vermisstes detailliertes Inhaltsverzeichnis) täuscht darüber hinweg, daß substantiell nur die Einleitung und ein Drittel des siebten Kapitels neu sind, wobei dieses Drittel mit nur sieben Seiten zur Anwendung literarischer Methoden in der johanneischen Forschung diesem einflußreichen Forschungszweig schwerlich gerecht wird. Die zweite Auflage bleibt wie die erste eine gute konservative Einleitung ins Johannesevangelium mit deutlichem Schwerpunkt auf historischen Fragen und weniger ausführlichen Anmerkungen zu den wichtigsten theologischen Themen des Johannesevangeliums.

RÉSUMÉ

Vingt ans après la parution de cet ouvrage, qui s'est largement répandu, Smalley en a remanié l'ensemble pour réaliser une nouvelle édition. Le changement est d'abord formel: le livre comporte dix chapitres au lieu de six précédemment, 340 pages au lieu de 285, environ 175 références bibliographiques y ont été ajoutées, ainsi qu'une table des matières détaillée. Mais ceci cache le fait que seuls l'introduction et un tiers du septième chapitre sont substantiellement nouveaux. L'addition au septième chapitre (limitée à sept pages) ne rend guère justice à l'utilisation de méthodes littéraires qui joue de nos jours un rôle important dans la recherche johannique. Cette deuxième édition est, comme la première, une bonne introduction conservatrice à l'Évangile de Jean. L'auteur s'attache surtout à la discussion des questions historiques et à des remarques moins substantielles sur les thèmes théologiques les plus importants du quatrième Évangile.

Twenty years ago, the first edition of this book was generally positively received. No less than 16 journals published reviews of the book

(according to the recent ATLA software). Assessments like 'the best introduction to the Fourth Gospel we have seen' (C. S. Rodd in *The Expository Times* 90 (1979), 98) and the subsequent reprints 1985, 1988, 1992 and 1994 reflect that the book has found an outstanding place among the vast literature on John's Gospel. However, additional quotations from previous reviewers may shed light on some of the problems already present in the first edition, problems which in this reviewers eyes remain in the new edition.

A problem zone of Johannine studies is the amount of recent literature and the question how to cope with it. Interestingly, Rodd in the above cited review said that 'Smalley has mastered a vast amount of recent literature and if for nothing else we should read the work to keep abreast of current thought on St. John.' Quite different is O'Grady's verdict: 'It seems to this reviewer that on those matters wherein agreement is almost unanimous, S. does well. On the areas of Johannine studies where there has been considerable development in the last five years, the author is weak. Provided the book is used with a series of more recent articles, it would be helpful to those beginning Johannine studies which perhaps would fulfill the purpose of this author. In future years S. might offer us his ability to present in clear form the results of the more recent work on the Fourth Gospel.' (J. F. O'Grady in *CBQ* 41 (1979), 499).

The new edition is a complete revision. About 175 additional titles in the bibliography (about 20 of which were published in 1976 or earlier) testify to the fact that Smalley has worked hard at the literature front. Another warmly welcomed formal feature that positively distinguishes the new edition from its predecessor is the detailed table of contents. A comparison of the new content with the old shows the following interesting feature: formally, the new book contains ten over against six chapters in the 1st ed. But only 1 ½ chapters contain additional material: the short first chapter which describes the full circle of Johannine studies drew in the question of John and the Synoptics (from John's dependence to independence, and back to different forms of dependence or openness in this area), and the short first part of chapter seven on the impact of literary methods in Johannine studies. It is at this point where the problem of recent trends in Johannine scholarship, already perceived in the 1978 edition, comes clearly into focus: whether one likes it or not, since Culpepper's *Anatomy of*

the Fourth Gospel narrative criticism has been the most important new influence in Johannine studies, and to spend merely seven pages on this area this reviewer can hardly regard as adequate.

All the other parts of the 2nd ed. present the same content as the first edition, although sometimes in a slightly different order (because of the lack of a detailed table of content in the 1st ed. one has to go through it page by page in order to find out which parts of the 1st ed. recur in which parts of the 2nd). One finds references to recent contributions in many footnotes of the 2nd ed., but Smalley's own approach remains basically unchanged: he argues for a three stage model which includes that (1.) the apostle John is the Beloved Disciple who moved from Jerusalem to Ephesus, where he was teaching about Jesus independently from the Synoptics, but according to common tradition supplemented by information from his own sources. (2.) These traditions were put into written form by disciples, and (3.) after John's death and the addition of the prologue and ch. 21 as an epilogue the Gospel was published by the Johannine church at Ephesus. As the title of the book says, Smalley sees John as both an evangelist and interpreter, who was both faithful to historical tradition and capable of profound theological interpretation. As in the 1st ed. the emphasis remains strongly on historical questions, although every important theological question is introduced in chapter 10 on 'John: Interpreter'. But critique from previous reviewers in this area remains valid (O'Grady, art. cit.: in tackling christological questions Smalley does not move beyond the christological titles; Kysar in *JBL* 99 (1980), 149: Smalley shows signs of reading back Chalcedonian problems into John's Gospel).

Another critique is worth mentioning briefly. In Barrett's view what Smalley is doing is 'a defense (!) of the soundness of the fourth evangelist'. He goes on: 'A defense, however, that leads to the proposition (p. 178) that "some parts of John's narrative are to be interpreted on a historical level, and others on a theological level" makes the worst of both worlds and does not do justice to the profundity of the evangelist' (Barrett in *JThSt* 30 (1979), 537). This serious critique is taken up in the 2nd ed. merely by altering the sentence in question in the following way: 'John's narrative may be interpreted at an historical, as well as theological, level.' (2nd ed., p. 217). This only shows that the relationship between history and theology is still

looking forward to be described in a more profound way.

This reviewer concludes that students of John's Gospel who are looking for an introductory book from a conservative viewpoint with a clear emphasis on historical questions (and who do not already possess the 1st ed.) will find the 2nd ed. a helpful guide. An introduction which pays equal attention to literary and theological questions, and attempts to clarify further their special relation to history in John's Gospel, remains to be written.

Rainer Behrens
Cheltenham, England

EuroJTh (1999) 8:1, 109-110 0960-2720

The Mark of the Spirit? A Charismatic Critique of the Toronto Blessing

L. Petersen (editor)

Carlisle: Paternoster Press, 1998,
121 pp., ISBN 0 85364 861 1

RÉSUMÉ

Ce livre examine le phénomène qu'est la bénédiction de Toronto, une expérience charismatique partie de Toronto en 1995 et qui a ensuite fait le tour du monde. Les quatre auteurs apportent chacun sa contribution pour répondre à l'ouvrage de Mark Stibbe qui considère la Bénédiction de Toronto comme un prélude à ce qui peut devenir un réveil mondial.

ZUSAMMENFASSUNG

Das vorliegende Buch untersucht das Phänomen des Toronto-Segens, einer charismatischen Erfahrung, die, ausgehend von Toronto im Jahr 1995, Verbreitung über die gesamte Welt erfahren hat. Jeder der vier Autoren steuert je einen Aufsatz bei zu einem Buch, das eine engagierte Reaktion ist auf das Werk von Mark Stibbe, der Toronto als Präludium zu einer möglichen weltweiten Erweckung auffaßt.

This book is a frontal assault on *Times of Refreshing* (Marshall Pickering, 1995), Mark Stibbe's defense of the Toronto phenomenon and his assertion that it is the first sign of a coming 'fourth wave' which will result in global revival. The four contributing essayists share Stibbe's association with Sheffield University's department of Biblical Studies