

The Medieval Theologians: an introduction to theology in the Medieval Period

Gill R Evans (ed.)

Oxford: Blackwell, 383 pp., £19.99, pb., I
SBN 0-631-21203-5

ZUSAMMENFASSUNG

Das Buch ist nach Meinung des Rezensenten die Summe wert, die für den Erwerb investiert werden muß. Die Darstellung mittelalterlicher Theologie setzt am Ausgang der Spätantike im 5. Jahrhundert ein. Nicht nur die Theologie der Karolingerzeit und des Hochmittelalters werden von verschiedenen Fachgelehrten dargestellt, sondern oft auch deren Spiritualität. Ebenfalls werden die mittelalterlichen Sekten wie Waldenser und Wycliffiten berücksichtigt. Schließlich werden die mittelalterlichen Voraussetzungen der Reformation dargestellt. Hierbei ist die dominierende Stellung des Augustinismus hervorzuheben. Der Rezensent vermißt die Frage nach der Bedeutung mittelalterlicher Theologie für heute, abgesehen von ihrer Vermittlung durch die Theologie der Reformation.

RÉSUMÉ

Voilà un ouvrage qui pourra donner envie au lecteur de suivre un cours sur la théologie médiévale, ou même d'enseigner ce sujet. L'histoire de la théologie du moyen âge commence à la fin de l'Antiquité tardive (5. siècle). Aussi bien qu'une sommaire de théologie des Carolingiens et du haut moyen âge, il y a beaucoup des pages consacrées aux sectes (les Cathares, Waldensiens, par exemple). L'influence de Saint Augustin a été dominante tout au long du moyen âge. On soupçonne que l'auteur n'est pas tant intéressé par les débats concernant la réforme que par ceux qui caractérisent le dialogue œcuménique contemporain.

L'ouvrage paraît déficient quant au contexte historique, il manque une discussion de la distinction entre philosophie et théologie, et il ne montre pas suffisamment l'intérêt de la théologie médiévale pour aujourd'hui.

This book is excellent value for money and may inspire the reader to start teaching or to enroll in a course on medieval theology. I shall here merely offer a running commentary on the contents. The editor's introduc-

tion seems rushed and unreflective, although her Preface is punchy and challenging ('The authors discusses in this volume..would have recoiled as the very idea of 'diversity'—vii). The authors on the chapters on The End of the Ancient World are simply given too much to do (Andrew Louth) or seem to have a particular take on Augustine (John Rist) which is interesting but perhaps not the best way of helping students get a grasp of 'Augustinianism'. Boethius deserves the pages given to Cassiodorus, and Gregory the Great is surely significant for things other than most of those discussed by Charles Kannengiesser.

In Part II ('The Carolingians') Bede is not really presented as a theologian: as Benedicta Ward admits, he saw his job as completing commentaries. After a patchy start it is a relief to get to Willemien Otten's chapter on four worthy Carolingian theological issues: adoptionism, icons, eucharist, predestination, although her touch is surest when it comes to the last of these four and the place of Eriugena (that of her own research).

The editor's own chapter on Berengar, Roscelin and Peter Damian seems like filling a gap in order to help Anselm stand out (and her parallel with the sixteenth century (misreading of Augustine is none too illuminating on p 87). To be told that the *Glossa Ordinaria* almost smothered the study of the bible in its cot is not *all* that helpful to understanding 'a medieval renaissance', but the four main chapters of this so-titled Part (III) of the book are gold. Gill Evans shows not only how Anselm was viewed as an innovator but that he *was* an innovator. L.O. Nielsen shows us how Abelard's theology of reason got to work on the neglected doctrine of the Holy Spirit contrasted with Gilbert of Poitiers' somewhat self-contradictory attempt to write on the Trinity. Emero Stiegmann, in an impressively well-researched piece, explains Bernard's theology of experience and how radical it was for his friend William of St. Thierry to equate knowledge and love for God with the Holy Spirit, and that the polymath Hugh of St Victor encouraged learning, yet made sure of a distinction between the *opus conditionis* and the *opus restorationis*. Fourth there is Marcia Colish who, drawing on her two-volume magisterial work on Peter Lombard, informs us that 'the Master' extended the 'signs theory' which Augustine had applied to Scripture to the case of the sacraments. Peter made progress with the doctrine of God, which needed an 'overhaul' and yet (at the other end of the tra-

ditional theological spectrum) focused on the sacraments and how canon law ties in with the practice of the church in Sentences IV.

Part IV is titled 'the High Medieval Debate'. Bonaventure is presented sympathetically, without one really getting a sense of how he transmitted Augustinian theology except in the (best but short) section on the *Breviloquium* (and the Sentences-Commentary). Fergus Kerr gets to do the chapter on Aquinas and helpfully explains the issue of unicity of substantial form in humans for which Aquinas controversially argued. For the case of Christ's body in the tomb, it was the *Word* which kept it from decay; there was no need for an extra *forma corporeitatis* which might give the body continuity between this side of death and the next. The chapter contains one or two obscure sentences, and I am not convinced that an annotated summary of contents through the Summa after *Prima Pars* q 14 is much use. It is also without endnotes, simply referring to the works of Kretzmann, Hankey, Finnis in a tiny bibliography (including an incomplete reference). O. Davies writes more about spirituality than theology as such; and even if one were to question such divisions, there is simply not enough on Eckhart for the chapter to be a success. The reader is caught between philosophy and spirituality. T. Shogimen on the Academic Debates tells us how Gerson helped to elevate the role of theologians in the church (the good old days!) but this would have been better as part of a 'background' piece at the start of the section, which the book generally lacks. Sandy Broadie on Scotus and Ockham is excellent, but the subject matter is, of course, difficult.

Moving on to Part V, the Chapter on 'Dualism' doesn't do much more than present some weird Gnostic/Cathar passages and a bit of history of sects. Nor does Euan Cameron, despite a brilliantly told narrative and a well-argued case for the orthodoxy of the Waldensians, show us how to access the world of Waldensian theology. Matthew Kempshall provides a very useful account of political theology in the high middle ages and Stephen Lahey, while informative and interesting on Wycliffite ontology and ecclesiology, suffers from condensation.

The final section titled 'conclusion' has an essay on Luther's debt to late medieval theologians. The end of the book is very much shaped towards the Reformation, which seems a bit old-fashioned in approach. Beware! In this last chapter there are some chunks of untranslated Latin! Last of all, Paul Rorem

shows how Augustine all the way through has been the dominant influence: 'even the occasional dash of Dionysius seems in long retrospect like an exotic oriental spice lightly seasoning the standard Augustinian loaf'. He questions BB Warfield's view that Augustine's doctrine of grace won and that his doctrine of the church lost. It might have been the other way round. One senses he is not so much interested in the Reformation debates (which are only cursorily mentioned) but in the ecumenical dialogues of today.

I am unconvinced that there is enough historical setting (or at least a bibliographical guide), a proper discussion of the philosophy/theology divide or any sense of the retrievability of the notions of medieval theology for today, as distinct from the Reformation era.

Mark W. Elliott
Liverpool, England

EuroJTh (2001) 10:2, 177-179

0960-2720

Christian Contradictions: the Structures of Lutheran and Catholic Thought

Daphne Hampson

Cambridge: CUP, 2001. 0 521 45060 8 (hb)
£40.00

ZUSAMMENFASSUNG

Mit diesem Buch nimmt die englische Feministin Daphne Hampson ein Thema wieder auf, das in den siebziger Jahren, bevor sie sich dem Feminismus zuwandte, bearbeitet hat. Hampson stellt die lutherische und die katholische Lehre nicht nur in der Reformationszeit, sondern auch bis zum 20. Jahrhundert dar. Dabei geht sie auch auf die katholische und evangelische Lutherdeutung neuerer Autoren wie Nygren, Bultmann, Joest, Dalferth, Pesch und den ökumenischen Dialog zwischen den Kirchen ein. Der Rezensent kritisiert, daß sich Hampson zu stark mit der Position Kierkegaards identifiziert. Die ersten drei Kapitel des Buches sind inhaltlich die stärksten.

RÉSUMÉ

Ce livre est très dense d'informations et d'idées et apporte bien des choses excellentes. Les trois premiers chapitres traitent de la « révolution » générée par Luther, de la voie catholique, et de la mauvaise compréhension de la théolo-