

mentioned in vv. 16-18 is not christological, but rather indicates YHWH. Further, by turning to the Lord the believer, in fulfilment of Jer 31:31ff and Ezek 36:26ff, has his hard heart removed so that he may now behold the glory of the Lord. This also means that the freedom of 3:17 is not freedom *from* the law, but rather freedom *for* the law. 2 Cor 3 thus doesn't contain negative and positive mentions of the law. Rather, the difference between the two ministries of Paul and Moses are to be based upon a 'salvation-history' contrast. This allows Hafemann to assert that Paul has a thoroughly positive view of the law both within the old and new covenants. While the whole monograph has been a detailed focus on just one chapter in Paul, he argues that 2 Cor 3 can be treated as paradigmatic for Paul's theology generally.

Not all critical responses to Hafemann's arguments have been fair. C. Marvin Pate (in *The Reverse of the Curse*, [Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2000]), for example, has arguably not entirely understood Hafemann's thesis. However, though Hafemann's contribution is detailed, creative and even at times brilliant, there remains the need for judicious reflection. First, as Pate has pointed out, 'letter' is perhaps better understood as indicative of the law itself. In this regard, Hafemann's questionable appeal to Rom 2:27-29 and 7:6 in support of his thesis needs to be challenged. His argument also raises more serious and broader questions: if the law is operative for the Christian then why does Paul teach that Christians are dead to the law in Romans 7:1-6? And if only part of the law remains binding on Christians, then what of Galatians 5:3 in which the law appears to be portrayed as an indivisible unity (cf. Pate)? Second, not all will be persuaded by Hafemann's interpretation of the Greek words καταργέω and τέλος even if the latter remains plausible to this author. As Pate writes: 'Hafemann's interpretation seems to be born out of a desire to extricate Paul from altering Exodus 34:29-35... [But if] Paul can recast Jeremiah 31:31-34 and Ezekiel 26:25f. by eliminating the presence of the law in the new covenant in Christ..., then so can he revise Exodus 34:29-35' (426). Third, Hafemann argues that the 'value of the LXX is seen most clearly... in *comparison* to the Hebrew tradition as its *Vorlage*' (191, 243-48). This is then often reduced to comparison of the LXX with the MT, which informs his arguments at various points. However, '[W]hile it is convenient to use BHS or BHK as a starting point for understanding what undergirded the LXX translations, it is dangerous, dishonest and wrong to assume that Leningradensis B 19A (MT) lay before the pre-Christian translators' (Cf. Melvin K. H. Peters, "Septuagint," in *The Anchor Bible Dictionary*. Vol 5. [London: Doubleday, 1992], 1100). Further, there exist particularly noteworthy anomalies between the LXX and the MT precisely at key verses in Hafemann's argument. For example, the existing Greek versions of Jeremiah and Ezekiel 36:23-38 were probably based upon different Hebrew texts than represented by the MT. Fourth, one wonders why Hafemann has not engaged with

the Psalmic tradition which describes those who have sought to behold the glory of God without any fear of death, but rather with expectation of delight (cf. Ps 42; 63). Finally, it is difficult to be as confident as Hafemann is in terms of the specific referent of the title κύριος in 3:16-18; the matter is more complicated than he seems to appreciate.

These points aside, this is a work of massive learning and piercing intellect that will repay anyone who takes the necessary time to work through his careful and detailed research.

Chris Tilling

Tübingen, Germany / London, England

*Laws of the Spiritual Order  
Innovation and Reconstruction in the Soteriology  
of Thomas Erskine of Linlathen*

Don Horrocks

Studies In Evangelical History And Thought; Milton  
Keynes: Paternoster, 2004

361 pp., pb, £24.99, ISBN 1-84227-192-x

SUMMARY

Don Horrocks' study of the theology of Thomas Erskine of Linlathen gives a deep insight into an important figure of Scottish theology. Erskine's theology is an incarnational one, because for him the our redemption can be understood only in the context of Christ's incarnation. He shows God as universal Father and as Holy Love. Horrocks introduces Erskine's theology and puts him in the context of his time period. An important opponent was the Scottish Federal Orthodoxy, an important influence was the Romantic movement. This book is a real help to discover a 19th century theologian who has very much to say to European Christians today.

ZUSAMMENFASSUNG

Don Horrocks' Studie der Theologie von Thomas Erskine von Linlathen bietet einen tiefen Einblick in eine wichtige Gestalt der schottischen Theologie. Diese ist inkarnatorisch; denn für ihn kann unsere Erlösung immer nur im Kontext der Menschwerdung Christi verstanden werden. Er zeigt Christus als universalen Vater und als Heilige Liebe. Horrocks führt in Erskines Theologie ein und stellt ihn in den Kontext seiner Zeit. Ein bedeutender Gegner war die schottische föderaltheologische Orthodoxie, ein wichtiger Einfluss die Romantik. Dieses Buch ist eine echte Hilfe, um einen Theologen des 19. Jahrhunderts zu entdecken, der auch den europäischen Christen von heute viel sagen kann.

RÉSUMÉ

Don Horrocks examine la théologie de Thomas Erskine de Linlathen et nous livre ainsi une vision claire et profonde de la pensée d'une figure importante de la théologie écosaisse. La théologie d'Erskine est centrée sur l'incarnation,



car, à ses yeux, notre rédemption ne peut se comprendre que dans le contexte de l'incarnation de Christ. Il dépeint Dieu comme Père universel et saint Amour. Horrocks présente cette théologie et la replace dans le contexte de son époque. L'orthodoxie fédérale écossaise a été pour lui un adversaire important, tandis que le mouvement romantique a exercé sur lui une influence considérable. Ce livre nous permet de découvrir un théologien du XIX<sup>e</sup> siècle qui a beaucoup à dire aux chrétiens d'Europe d'aujourd'hui.

\* \* \* \*

Horrocks starts the first of the two parts of his study with an introduction to Thomas Erskine, a Scottish lay theologian who was a 'key transitional figure' (1) between the 18th century Federal Orthodoxy and today. He was influenced by different theological sources, one of which was German Pietism. He was in close contact with several important theologians of his time, e.g. John McLeod Campbell, F.D. Maurice and George MacDonald.

Horrocks shows us Erskine's emphasis to renew his readers 'Perception of God' (27). Instead of as a judge God has to be understood as 'Holy Love' (29) and as universal Father. He is a relational God whose coming into the flesh is a coming into us. He is himself a God defined by the Father-Son-relation in himself. And he is the universal Father of all human beings.

Erskine was influenced by the Romantic movement. Instead of the authority of external evidences he emphasised the authority of internal ones. For him experience was of highest importance, especially the self-evidence of moral change. This was founded upon his belief in the restoration of the human nature through the incarnation, which makes his theology deeply incarnational. Man has to will God's will, he can have something as a 'new birth'. There are close parallels between Erskine and Wesley, which could – even if it is not mentioned by Horrocks – make Erskine a bridge between the Calvinistic and the Methodist tradition.

Saving Faith provokes for Erskine a living response from the heart to the inward voice of God. His version of Calvinism can be called 'mystical'. Salvation is a 'real union with God'. Justification is a process. In 'Erskine's thought salvation and sanctification became virtually anonymous' (95). There is 'an ever-present sanctifying influence in the heart' (103). Through his strong linking of the 'atonement with incarnation' (105) the whole life and not only the death of Christ become important to understand salvation. Yet Erskine's doctrine that Christ's death has no intrinsic salvific efficacy was controversial. This shows clearly the differences between Erskine's theology and the theological background of his time. An interesting point is that he changes the Scottish Federal Orthodoxy not so much by inventing new terms but by redefining the traditional ones.

Another interesting point is Erskine's view of suffering. For him it is one of God's tools to educate humans. So his theodicy has influences on his soteriology. Human

suffering has its share in the redemption, yet the foundation for this redeeming function of human suffering is Christ's suffering. Then Erskine understands Christ not as the substitute of humans but as the head of humanity. According to Horrocks it is doubtful whether Erskine was really successful in keeping the singularity of Christ's sacrifice. For Erskine sin is a disease, which has to be healed. He has a tendency 'like Schleiermacher and F. D. Maurice to regard sin in terms of self-centredness, individualism and alienation' (124). Erskine changes the Calvinistic understanding of election. For him in choosing Christ, the one elect, human beings become elect. So in some way an act of co-operation between God and man is necessary. Horrocks mentions Erskine's 'anticipation of soteriological aspects of Karl Barth's theology' (130).

Of course Erskine's theology was heavily attacked. From the side of the Calvinistic orthodoxy especially James A. Haldane was a strong critic. Another opponent was the Methodist Richard Watson. According to him Erskine was a Semi-Pelagian. The main critique was that he had a too psychological understanding of the Spirit. Horrocks defends Erskine against these attacks and tries to explain them as misunderstandings in the context of the strong influence of philosophical idealism in his time. According to another critic – John H. Newman – the logical outcome of Erskine's theology leads to rationalism, which does not take the mystery seriously enough. For his view of conversion it was important that everybody is offered God's grace, but that it is man's decision to accept it or not. As an overreaction against the Calvinism of his time Erskine develops a positive view of human nature. Yet for him salvation is only possible in Christ.

In the second part Horrocks tries to understand Erskine in the context of his time. He shows that he is influenced both by the Enlightenment and by the Romantic movement. One of Erskine's most important sources is William Law who stood in close connection with John Wesley and emphasised the importance of divine love. However, according to Horrocks the influence of Edward Irving is less important than previously thought. Furthermore a number of other mystical theologians influenced Erskine, among them Boehme and the Quakers. Erskine himself influenced theologians like John McLeod Campbell and F. D. Maurice.

Erskine stood in a wider context than that of Scottish theology. In his own time there was a strong German influence and Erskine builded on it and helped to introduce it more deeply to British theology. Two important roots for the German influence on him were his friend A. J. Scott and the family of Madame de Stael. Erskine's visit in Herrnhut shows his openness for one of the oldest traditions of German pietism. Then there are close connections between Erskine's theology and some continental tendencies, especially the theological school of Erlangen. Their questions and answers were similar. So the 19th century theological transitions in Britain and



Germany are closely interwoven. Horrocks shows this European dimension of Erskine. This dimension makes it helpful for European Christians to look at Thomas Erskine of Linlathen. And this study is a good intro-

duction to this remarkable theologian of 19th century Scotland.

Thomas Gerold  
Munich, Germany

## NEW FROM PATERNOSTER

### Leadership in the Salvation Army A Case Study in Clericalisation

Harold Hill

The Salvation Army provides a case study of the way in which renewal movements in the church institutionalise. Their leadership roles, initially merely functional and based on the principle of 'the priesthood of all believers', begin to assume greater status. The Army continues to exhibit a tension between its theology, which supports equality of status, and its military structure, which works against equality, and both schools of thought flourish within its ranks.

Harold Hill is a Major in The Salvation Army: New Zealand, Fiji and Tonga Territory

978-1-84227-429-3 / 229x152mm / 358pp / £24.99

### Blood and Fire, Tsar and Commissar The Salvation Army in Russia 1907-1923

Tom Aitken

*Blood and Fire, Tsar and Commissar* examines the Salvation Army's first attempt to establish itself in Russia during the early decades of the twentieth century. It is a stirring story of faith, determination and endurance of a would-be law-abiding organisation struggling (despite police raids, death by epidemic and other catastrophes) to work in a place where, prior to the revolutions of 1917, it did not officially exist.

*'A fresh and stimulating contribution to the story of the Salvation Army.'*

Ruth Windscheffel

Tom Aitken is a freelance writer and lecturer on history, film, music and literature, currently writing for *The Times Literary Supplement* and *The Church Times*, and lecturing at St Deiniol's Library and the Graham Greene Festival.

978-1-84227-511-5 / 229 x 152mm / 342pp / £24.99

### Grace and Global Justice The Socio-Political Mission of the Church in an Age of Globalization

Richard Gibb

What does it mean for the twenty-first-century church to conceive of itself as a community defined by the covenant of grace? *Grace and Global Justice* explores the ramifications of this central Christian doctrine for the holistic mission of the church in the context of a globalized world. Gibb shows how the church can be a voice for justice on behalf of the global poor by affirming its mission as a community of grace.

*'Extremely insightful.'*

Richard Mouw

*'An insightful and pertinent analysis.'*

Alan Torrance

Richard Gibb is Assistant Minister of Charlotte Chapel, Edinburgh, UK.

978-1-84227-459-0 / 229 x 152mm / 266pp / £19.99

Paternoster, 9 Holdom Avenue, Bletchley, Milton Keynes MK1 1QR, UK