

The present substantial collection is volume six of Hengel's *Kleine Schriften*. Previous volumes were *Judaica et Hellenistica* (1996), *Judaica, Hellenistica et Christiana* (1999), *Paulus und Jakobus* (2002), *Studien zur Christologie* (2006) and *Jesus und die Evangelien* (2007; all in the WUNT series, Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck). The present volume not only contains reprints of essays but also of three of Hengel's "shorter" monographs. In view of the size of some of Hengel's books, one could consider a monograph of moderate length indeed as a *Kleine Schrift*! *Kleine Schriften VI* contains seventeen texts written between 1971 and 2007. The essays have been checked by the author, some of them have been supplemented (mainly with more recent bibliography).

Several contributions address aspects of Luke-Acts as historiography as the foundation for an understanding of early Christianity. Others focus on the origins of Gnosticism, early Christian mission, other aspects of early Christian history, including social history, as well as on crucifixion. The reprinted monographs and some of the essays have also appeared in English. In some cases I have noted this below.

The volume starts with *Zur urchristlichen Geschichtsschreibung* (1-104; Stuttgart: Calwer, 1979; 2nd ed. 1984; cf. Hengel's *Acts and the History of Early Christianity*; London: SCM, 1979), followed by "Die Ursprünge der christlichen Mission" (105-35; 1971/72); "Die Anfänge der urchristlichen Mission" (136-39; a review from *ThLZ* 96, 1971, 913-15); "Der Historiker Lukas und die Geographie Palästinas in der Apostelgeschichte (140-90; 1983; English: "The Geography of Palestine in Acts", in R. Bauckham [ed.], *The Book of Acts in Its Palestinian Setting*, AFCS IV; Grand Rapids: Eerdmans; Carlisle: Paternoster, 1995, 27-78); "Joudaia in der geographischen Liste Apg 2,9-11 und Syrien als 'Großjudäa'" (191-211; 2000); "Der Jude Paulus und sein Volk: Zu einem neuen Acta-Kommentar" (212-41; a review from *ThR* 66, 2001, 338-368) and "Der Lukasprolog und seine Augenzeugen: Die Apostel, Petrus und die Frauen" (242-97; 2007).

Other essays concern early Christianity more generally: "Problems of a History of Earliest Christianity" (298-312; 1997); "Überlegungen zu einer Geschichte des frühesten Christentums im 1. und 2. Jahrhundert" (313-52; 2002); followed by a reprint of *Eigentum und Reichtum in der frühen Kirche: Aspekte einer frühchristlichen Sozialgeschichte* (353-423; originally Stuttgart: Calwer, 1973; English translation: *Property and Riches in the Early Church: Aspects of a Social History of Early Christianity*; London: SCM, 1974); "Die Arbeit im frühen Christentum" (424-66; 1986); "Königsherrschaft Gottes und himmlischer Kult" (467-87; together with A. M. Schwemer; the text is the preface to *Königsherrschaft Gottes und himmlischer Kult im Judentum, Urchristentum und in der hellenistischen Welt*, edited by Hengel and Schwemer, WUNT 55; Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 1991, 1-19); "Qumran und das frühe Christentum" (488-96; originally published in French as "Les

manuscris de Qumran et les origines chrétiennes" in *Hommage rendu à André Dupont-Sommer*, CRAI 4/2003, 41-51) and "Die Heiden" (497-507; preface from *Die Heiden: Juden, Christen und das Problem des Fremden*, eds. R. Feldmeier, U. Heckel, WUNT 70; Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 1994).

Further essays are "Die 'auserwählte Herrin', die 'Braut', die 'Mutter' und die 'Gottesstadt'" (508-48; 2000); "Die Ursprünge der Gnosis und das Urchristentum" (549-93; 1997) and "*Mors turpissima crucis*: Die Kreuzigung in der antiken Welt und die 'Torheit' des 'Wortes vom Kreuz'" (594-652; 1976). The last essay appeared in expanded form as *Crucifixion in the Ancient World and the Folly of the Message of the Cross* (London: SCM, 1977; Minneapolis: Fortress, 1978).

While some of the essays are dated and deserved major revision (e.g. the two contributions on early Christian mission from the early seventies), all of them are characterised by Hengel's mastery of the field, admirable knowledge of the sources and careful philological and historically sober approach that does not lose sight of the larger theological issues. They also witness to Hengel's readiness to state and argue his case and critically to engage scholars who have not done their homework properly.

Christoph Stenschke

Der mündliche Faktor und seine Bedeutung für die synoptische Frage: Analogien aus der antiken Literatur, der Experimentalpsychologie, der Oral Poetry-Forschung und dem rabbinischen Traditionswesen
Armin D. Baum

Texte und Arbeiten zum neutestamentlichen Zeitalter
49

Tübingen: Francke 2008, XVII + 526 pp., € 78, -, hb,
ISBN 978-3-7720-8266-5

SUMMARY

Baum defends a tradition hypothesis according to which the Synoptic Gospels represent 'the result of an oral tradition based on human memory'. The early Christians memorised the sequence of the pericopes in Mark which are considered the fundamental framework of all three Synoptic Gospels, learning the wording more or less by heart. This was not too difficult because the words of Jesus in the Synoptics only amount to about two hours of discourse time; the remaining synoptic material covers a similar extent. Baum relates the discrepancies among the Synoptics to verified characteristics of oral tradition processes; these characteristics also offer a valid explanation for those phenomena which may represent "anomalies" from the perspective of the Two Source Theory.

ZUSAMMENFASSUNG

Baum vertritt eine Traditionshypothese: Die Synoptiker sind „das Resultat einer vom menschlichen Gedächtnis getragenen mündlichen Überlieferung.“ Die Christen prägten sich damals die – das Grundgerüst aller drei Synoptiker bildende – Reihenfolge der Mk-Perikopen ein, und lernten den ungefähren Wortlaut auswendig. Das war nicht schwer, denn die Aussagen Jesu in den Synoptikern umfassen insgesamt nur etwa zwei Stunden Redezeit; der übrige synoptische Stoff ist ähnlich umfangreich. Baum argumentiert folgendermaßen: Er setzt die Unterschiede zwischen den Synoptikern mit nachgewiesenen Eigenheiten mündlichen Überlieferens in Bezug, und diese Eigenheiten bieten gute Erklärungen auch für jene Erscheinungen, die aus der Sicht der Zwei-Quellen-Theorie „Anomalien“ darstellen.

RÉSUMÉ

Baum se penche sur les Évangiles synoptiques avec l'hypothèse qu'ils sont « le produit d'une tradition orale fondée sur le souvenir des hommes ». Les chrétiens de l'époque mémorisaient selon lui les séquences des péripécopes de l'Évangile de Marc, qu'il considère comme formant la colonne vertébrale des trois synoptiques, et ils en apprenaient le contenu par cœur mot pour mot. Ce n'était pas très difficile dans la mesure où la somme des paroles de Jésus contenues dans les synoptiques forme un discours de deux heures. Le reste de la matière des synoptiques est de longueur similaire. Son argumentation est la suivante : il lie les différences entre les synoptiques aux particularités reconnues de la tradition orale. Ces particularités permettent de rendre compte des données qui apparaissent comme des anomalies du point de vue de la théorie des deux sources.

* * * *

According to Baum's tradition hypothesis, the Synoptic Gospels are 'the result of an oral tradition process based upon human memory' (361, 390) and not of literary dependence. In terms of the so-called Two Source Theory, he argues that the original Mark was oral and not written. The early Christians memorised the sequence of the pericopes in Mark which form the fundamental framework of all three Synoptic Gospels, learning the actual wording by heart in a fairly accurate way. Baum assumes that the oral transmission of the synoptic material lasted for several decades (401).

The direct speech of Jesus in the Synoptics consists of about 15,000 words (208), that is approximately two hours of continuous discourse. When we include John's Gospel, there are 'three hours of Jesus speeches' (the title of a chapter in my book *Jesus und seine Schüler*, 1991, 28). 120 words correspond to about one minute of discourse (which equals on average one pericope of Mark). The remaining Synoptic material takes another two hours to recite; repetitions are counted only once (178).

In some materials the Synoptic Gospels have almost

exactly the same wording; this applies in particular to quotations from the Old Testament, but also to words of Jesus which are in a poetic form, e.g. in the shape of *parallelismus membrorum*. This observation alone makes literary dependence very unlikely since the memory of the evangelists at least plays a part. In practice, many New Testament scholars prefer a mixed model instead of the alternative 'oral' or 'written'; they combine written and oral aspects.

It is absolutely plausible that members of a largely oral and memorising culture would be able to learn by heart the four hours of synoptic material which were mentioned above, partly literally and partly at least the broad outlines. The vivid imagery of the parables of Jesus – which make up 30% of his speeches (242) – and of the narratives helps easy memorisation of the contents. Nevertheless, not only the wording matters but also the sequence of the material. According to Baum, the sequence of the pericopes as they appear in Mark's Gospel was also committed to memory. For the events at Jerusalem starting with Jesus' entry (Mk 11:1) and, in particular, for the passion and resurrection narratives, the order is given with the plot. Therefore, the order of these approximately 40 pericopes can be memorised fairly easily. The nearly 60 pericopes of Mark's first ten chapters are less easy to organise. Yet in his book *The Mark Experiment* (2004), Andrew Page established that the sequence of all Mark's pericopes can be memorised within a few hours also by people of today. So a predominance of the 'oral factor' in the development of the Synoptic Gospels seems possible. But is it also probable?

Baum approaches the synoptic problem by comparing "similarity profiles": he records the specific profile of agreements and discrepancies among the Synoptics quantitatively and compares it with the similarities between other parallel texts of Antiquity. Baum observes a rather close proximity to parallel texts which had developed orally, mainly to rabbinic traditions. This becomes especially evident when comparing both versions of *Avot de Rabbi Nathan*. This similarity in profile supports Baum's argument. On the other hand, he uses evidence against literary dependence. With only 43% identical words between the Synoptics, copying seems unlikely (52). In parallel texts from the Old Testament we see double the percentage of identical words, roughly 80% (109). The combination of extensive similarity in content and limited similarity in wording is the natural result of human mental activity. We tend to remember content (especially that of vivid imagery) rather quickly whereas exact wordings require frequent repetition (244).

Of course, Baum also refers to the more than 600 *minor agreements* of Mt and Lk against Mk, which are a thorn in the flesh of the Two Source Theory. Baum puts these agreements down to oral versions of Mark's material (382). Mnemonic psychology teaches us about our particularities when we come to memorising narratives: we tend to limit ourselves to the main plot and omit some details and names (250). As a result, the

Markan material in the Gospel of Mark appears to be more natural; in this respect, Baum supports 'Markan priority' (252). The differences among the three Synoptic Gospels go well with Baum's idea that the Synoptics partly included the same materials handed down orally. Mark preserved more names; these were not eliminated by Mt and Lk during the process of copying but simply forgotten either by Mt and Lk themselves or by their traditors.

Sometimes, Luke's prologue is wrongly used as an argument to prove that Lk is based on written sources; it is true that Luke mentions predecessors, but as his sources he specifies the tradition of eye witnesses (83f.).

The tradition hypothesis becomes plausible because Baum takes into consideration all relevant analogies (387), i.e. he includes our knowledge of memorising information and of oral traditions such as oral poetry and analogies from Antiquity. He relates the differences between the Synoptics to the verified characteristics of oral tradition; and these characteristics even offer valid explanations for phenomena which represent 'anomalies' from the perspective of the Two Source Theory.

At the end of each chapter Baum summarises the results, which helps the reader to get the broad picture. He carefully weighs his arguments examining to which extent a certain fact can also be reconciled with a theory of literary dependence (e.g. 209). Therefore, one is able to follow in detail Baum's presentation of data and his conclusions.

In particular because of his comments on quantity, Baum's interdisciplinary approach is a very labour-intensive enterprise. The effort was worthwhile because, thanks to his bringing together separate domains of scholarship, the oral tradition hypothesis becomes very convincing.

Franz Graf-Stublhöfer, Vienna, Austria

The Unique and Universal Christ. Jesus in a plural world

Michael Nazir-Ali

Milton Keynes/Colorado Springs/Hyderabad: Paternoster, 2008;

xii + 158 pp; p/b, £9.99, ISBN: 978-1-84227-551-1

SUMMARY

The former Bishop of Rochester argues forcefully that the fundamental values and virtues that are needed today for human flourishing arise from a Christian vision that is centred on the person and work of Jesus Christ. Accordingly, he deals with the doctrine of Christ, points out the need for a new start with God and ourselves if there is to be any personal and social transformation, lays out different ways of relating Christ to culture, e.g. affirming God-given aspects as well as refusing those that have to do with our fallenness, discusses the relationship of the gospel to people of other

faiths as well as these faiths themselves, and explores the consequences for mission and Church arising from such a Jesus-focused vision.

ZUSAMMENFASSUNG

Der frühere Bischof von Rochester, Dr. Michael Nazir-Ali, hielt 2007 die Chavasse Lectures in Wycliffe Hall, Oxford. Dieses Buch ist die gedruckte Version, in der der Bischof nachdrücklich argumentiert, dass die grundlegenden Werte und Tugenden, die heute für das Aufblühen des Menschen benötigt werden, von einer christlichen Vision herrühren, die auf die Person und das Werk Jesu Christi zentriert ist. Von daher behandelt er die Lehre von Christus, betont die Notwendigkeit eines Neubeginns mit Gott und mit uns selbst für jegliche echte persönliche und soziale Veränderung, skizziert verschiedene Wege, Christus mit der Kultur in Beziehung zu bringen, z. B. das Bestätigen gottgegebener Aspekte und das Zurückweisen von Aspekten, die mit unserem gefallenem Zustand zutun haben, diskutiert die Beziehung des Evangeliums zu Menschen anderer Glaubensrichtungen ebenso wie diese Glaubensrichtungen als solche und untersucht die Konsequenzen für die Mission und die Kirche, die so eine auf Jesus zentrierte Vision hervorruft.

RÉSUMÉ

L'ancien évêque de Rochester, Michael Nazir-Ali, a été invité comme orateur en 2007 pour les conférences Chavasse du Wycliffe Hall à Oxford. Ses exposés sont repris ici. L'évêque affirme avec force que les valeurs et les vertus fondamentales qui sont aujourd'hui nécessaires à l'épanouissement humain sont celles qui découlent d'une pensée chrétienne centrée sur la personne et l'œuvre de Jésus-Christ. Il traite donc de la doctrine de Christ, souligne la nécessité d'un nouveau départ avec Dieu et soi-même pour toute transformation personnelle et sociale, et indique différentes manières de mettre Christ en rapport avec la culture. Il s'agit par exemple d'affirmer ce qui provient de Dieu et de rejeter ce qui résulte du péché. L'auteur traite encore de la relation entre l'Évangile et les adeptes d'autres religions, entre l'Évangile et ces autres religions elles-mêmes. Il explore les conséquences de cette vision christocentrique pour la mission et l'Église.

* * * *

In this book of six chapters Bishop Michael Nazir-Ali sets off by suggesting that dignity, liberty, equality and safety are recognized values all over the world. These values, however, can hardly be understood or sustained unless we recognize that they are rooted in the Judaeo-Christian view, moral vision and virtues. This does not rule out freedom, space and recognition for others in an increasingly pluralist society. In acknowledging differences lies the key to understanding and defining areas of mutual cooperation.

Nazir-Ali next examines who this Jesus is – the unique and universal Christ. The basic source remains the New Testament, but he draws on contributions from Muslim,