

ogy and theodicy, it is the remaining essays which are likely to provoke the most comment. For these address quite pointedly the usefulness of the scholastic method in modern dogmatic construction, displaying a complete spectrum of opinions. Most critical is G. van den Brink who argues that Reformed scholasticism was largely responsible for the marginalisation of the Trinity in seventeenth-century theology. At fault he views the conceptual tools of scholasticism itself which divorced discussion of the divine trinity from the divine essence. Much more positive evaluations are given by Sarot and by L.J. van den Brom, with the former arguing that the conceptual tools of philosophical theology reflect a new, reformed mode of scholastic enquiry and the latter suggesting the contemporary fruitfulness of an 'open scholasticism' able to appropriate the relational and covenantal language of Reformed theologians such as Cocceius. In the final essay of the collection, B. Loonstra provides a brief but stout defence of the Reformed scholastic enterprise, arguing that all realist accounts of the theology presuppose an analytic method.

Scholasticism Reformed is an important work which not only extends the reach of current studies on Reformed scholasticism, but also addresses the relevance of the scholastic method for the modern theological enterprise. On the whole the essays vindicate the new school interpretation of Van Asselt and his colleagues, demonstrating not only the metaphysical sophistication of Reformed scholasticism but also its intimate link to the piety and exegesis of the Reformation age. While difficulties concerning the new school interpretation are raised, notably by Otten and Van den Brink, these are unlikely to prove insuperable and will hopefully lead to further nuancing of our understanding of the scholastic enterprise broadly conceived. In terms of contemporary theological application it is clear that Reformed scholasticism, with its metaphysical subtleties and secure biblical grounding, is once again becoming a force to be reckoned with. While its philosophical form and idiom are unlikely to prove attractive to all evangelical theologians this is nevertheless a very welcome development.

Simon Burton,
Edinburgh, Scotland

The Reformation of Feeling. Shaping the Religious Emotions in Early Modern Germany

Susan C. Karant-Nunn

Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2010, 342 pp,
\$74.00, hb, ISBN 978-0-19-539973-8

RÉSUMÉ

L'auteur analyse l'influence des ecclésiastiques catholiques, luthériens et réformés sur les émotions religieuses dans la première période de l'Allemagne moderne. En présentant les traits caractéristiques des expressions d'émotion dans les différentes traditions, essentiellement en comparant les

productions homilétiques, elle aboutit à un curieux panorama historique d'expérience religieuse inter-dénominationnelle. Un aspect unique de son travail réside dans la description de la piété émotionnelle de la gent féminine laïque. Malgré certaines ambiguïtés conceptuelles, l'ouvrage apporte une contribution importante à l'étude historique de l'expérience religieuse. Les pasteurs, les théologiens et les historiens tireront profit de cet excellent travail.

ZUSAMMENFASSUNG

Susan C. Karant-Nunn analysiert, wie katholische, lutherische und reformierte Kirchenleute zur Bildung religiöser Gefühle im Deutschland der frühen Moderne beigetragen haben. Sie verfolgt die emotionalen Charakteristiken der unterschiedlichen Traditionen, meist auf dem Weg des homiletischen Vergleichs, und unterbreitet einen faszinierenden historischen Bericht über überkonfessionelle religiöse Erfahrungen. Ein einzigartiges Merkmal von Karant-Nunns Projekt ist ihre Beschreibung der emotionalen Frömmigkeit weiblicher Laien in der frühen Moderne. Trotz einiger gedanklicher Unstimmigkeiten, leistet das Buch einen beträchtlichen Beitrag zur historischen Erforschung religiöser Erfahrung. Pfarrer, Theologen und Historiker werden gleichermaßen Gewinn aus diesem ausgezeichneten Werk ziehen.

SUMMARY

Susan C. Karant-Nunn analyses how Catholic, Lutheran and Reformed ecclesiastics shaped religious emotions in early modern Germany. In tracing the emotional features of the different traditions, for the most part by means of homiletic comparisons, the author presents an intriguing historical account of inter-denominational religious experience. A unique feature of Karant-Nunn's endeavour is her description of the emotional piety of early-modern female lay persons. Despite some conceptual ambiguity, the book contributes greatly to the historical study of religious experience. Pastors, theologians and historians will equally benefit from this excellent work.

* * * *

With *The Reformation of Feeling*, Susan C. Karant-Nunn, Professor of History at the University of Arizona, ventures into a stimulating study located at the crossroads of history, psychology and theology. The author aptly defines the goal of her challenging endeavour as: 'this book is about the ways in which Catholic, Lutheran, and Calvinist ecclesiastical leaders in sixteenth- and seventeenth-century Germany tried to shape the religious feelings of those in their charge' (3). With historical sensitivity and literary elegance, Karant-Nunn successfully delivers on this promise and takes the reader back to a fascinating time. In the first three chapters, she carefully analyses the homiletic characteristics of Catholic, Lutheran and Calvinist clergymen and traces the emotional content and the impact of their sermons on the listeners.

According to the author, Catholic preachers focused

on detailed portrayals of the physical horrors of the crucifixion; they invoked the pious to identify with their suffering Saviour, which should preferably manifest itself visibly, such as in the shedding of tears. Lutheran ministers, on the other hand, abandoned this practice and rather encouraged their audience to apply the accomplished atonement to their lives, the emotive key word here being consolation (*Tröst*). Calvinistic divines, argues Karant-Nunn, departed even further from the Catholic tradition; the main emotion to be condoned and stimulated was shame about one's own sinfulness.

The subsequent fourth chapter deals with (negative) feelings which preachers across all denominations expressed and endorsed towards the Jews. Karant-Nunn then gives an account of diverse descriptions of Mary's feelings and sufferings, which obviously vary in degree and quality depending on the confession (chapter five), while also dealing with feelings related to death and dying 'in and around the death-bed' (chapter 6). A unique feature of this study is the cross-gender comparison of the literary output of female lay persons with their male professional contemporaries, allowing for an exciting insight into early-modern female emotional piety (chapter 7). Throughout the work, Karant-Nunn also includes, apart from homiletic material, fitting illustrations on visual, religious arts, thereby painting a comprehensive and convincing picture of early-modern religious culture and tradition.

While the book enjoys all these advantages, it suffers from two setbacks. First, it lacks a clear definition of the main concepts such as 'emotion' and 'feeling', in particular in contrast to 'cognition' and 'volition'. By providing these, the author would have safeguarded herself from the pitfall of succumbing to conflating these intrinsically related but clearly separated concepts. Karant-Nunn, for example, names as 'dominant emotions of the deathbed... profound sorrow for sin... and total acceptance of God's will' (191). This latter 'acceptance' is obviously conceptually closer to a cognitive-volitional appraisal rather than being an emotional experience. Similarly, the author mistakes 'submission to God's will' as "feeling" (205) rather than an act on the volitional level. A more robust conceptual basis could also have equipped the author with more explanative power, the lack of which Karant-Nunn herself apparently notices. After 250 of 255 pages of the main text, she observes, 'What we have not sufficiently appreciated is the extent to which each denomination was determined to appeal to the emotions as an indispensable underpinning of belief and deportment' (250). A more robust terminological foundation would presumably have facilitated these significant judgments.

Secondly, and this addresses more the theological nature of the work, Karant-Nunn runs the risk of reheating classic opinions on Calvinism, and in particular on John Calvin as a person. One cannot expect the author, as a historian, to be an expert in Catholicism, Lutheranism and Calvinism. However, one would have

wished for a more balanced approach, notably in her treatment of Calvinism. One reads that 'Calvin is in fact more dour than most and as disciplinary as any, a man of determination to impress upon his listeners their utter worthlessness... In my view, Calvin borders on the vindictive, sometimes forgetting even rhetorically to include himself within the ranks of the wretched' (128, emphasis original). What is more, Karant-Nunn opines that 'It is hard to imagine Calvin as "ravished with love," even with God... Luther could envision having a Father-son talk with God... Calvin, I think, could not entertain such a concept' (130). A consideration of Calvin's letters, recent scholarly biographies (such as that of Bruce Gordon), as well as Nigel Westhead's and Tim Trummer's treatments on Calvin's unique emphasis on the fatherhood of God easily exposes these (unfortunately not uncommon) claims as dated clichés.

Despite these limitations, *The Reformation of Feeling* is an elaborate piece of work which, with its meticulous and expedient translations of long-forgotten sermons and pious works from diverse confessional backgrounds, sheds light on a fascinating era in the history of the Christian church. Curious students and professionals from the fields of history, psychology and theology will benefit greatly from this ground-breaking work.

Michael Bräutigam,
Edinburgh, Scotland

Alle Gotteserkenntnis entsteht aus Vernunft und Offenbarung: Wilhelm Lütgerts Beitrag zur theologischen Erkenntnistheorie

Studien zur systematischen Theologie und Ethik 63

Peter Müller

Münster: Lit Verlag, 2012, 297 pp., €31.90, pb, ISBN 978-3-643-80120-3

RÉSUMÉ

Dans cette thèse de doctorat, Peter Müller considère la vie et l'œuvre de Wilhelm Lütgert en s'intéressant tout particulièrement à son épistémologie théologique et à sa foi fondée sur le concept de création. Pour la première fois, toutes les sources biographiques disponibles sont examinées. Cela peut permettre d'apporter un éclairage nouveau sur le point de vue critique de Lütgert sur une théologie chrétienne allemande, sur sa mise à la retraite forcée, et sur ses relations avec ses contemporains. Müller le présente comme adhérent à une épistémologie réaliste. Partant de là, il expose sa pensée comme un plaidoyer pour une théologie de la création.

SUMMARY

In his dissertation Peter Müller presents the life and work of Wilhelm Lütgert in the perspective of a theological epistemology and of founding faith on the doctrine of crea-